

"Investigating Aspects of Corporate Citizenship on Private Game Farms: The case of Mtshelazi Game Reserve in Makana Municipality, Eastern Cape Province"

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of

MASTER OF BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION

Of

RHODES UNIVERSITY

By

CYNTHIA NYAMA

March 2008

Supervised by

Dr Andrew Ainslie

Abstract

Research show that post 1996 period has experienced an unprecedented increase in game based operations. The corporate citizenship or corporate social responsibility of the game reserves is of much interest to this study with a focus on the rights of previous and current occupants of farms, workers' well-being, job creation, quality of life and poverty alleviation within the game/tourism industry.

The research was conducted as a qualitative case study and the tools employed for data gathering include: a review of the relevant literature, interviews (face-to-face), the administering of a questionnaire survey and document analysis from diversity of resources which include the Department of Labour, East Cape Agricultural Research Project, and through use of multiple data sources. The approach taken in this dissertation is to examine to what extent the private game reserves in the Makana Municipality can be labelled as "corporate citizens" and this was done by means of a case study of one private game reserve.

The areas that are deemed to be most important in this regard are (i) employment history (ii) educational opportunities (iii) wages (iv) housing (v) land tenure. The study established that younger, better educated people are likely to secure better paying employment on PGR. The nature and conditions of sale of the farm to the PGR can impact on the employment secured by workers in the new dispensation. Workers are tired to these jobs because of the very long hours that prevent them from doing anything else to earn money. Some of the workers had opportunities to learn new skills but the question remains; which people are these and how long will growing differentials in earnings reproduce the poorly educated worker in the next generation. The study also highlighted the need for academics and researchers to come with a common set of corporate citizenship measures such as to measure corporate social impacts.

Acknowledgements

Firstly I would like to thank my heavenly father God Almighty for granting me wisdom, strength and healthy mind and body.

I also want to press my sincere appreciation to my husband, James Gambiza (Dr), our three children Fortune, Desmond and Amanda for their patience, tolerance, love and support throughout my studies. To my husband James, your encouragements made this work possible and to our children, never forget how special you are, you are my heroes and without you all, I would not have made it. To my mother Mrs Nellie Nyama, for her un wavering love, support, prayers and tolerance especially when the going got tough. I thank you Mum for your words of encouragement

To my supervisor, Dr Andrew Ainslie, I am for your encouragement, support, patience, guidance; you helped to shape this study

I am indebted to the Mtshelezi game reserve owner and his employers, for whom without their cooperation and willingness to be interviewed; I could not have carried out this study.

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis to my late father, Lynne William Wilfred Nyama, whose presence. I felt right through the entire study. I made a promise to you over 20 years ago, that I would do a masters degree for you as it had always been your desire to do one but due to ill-health you could not, I have done it dad, its all yours.

Contents

Abstract.....	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Dedication	iii
Contents	iv
Table of content.....	iv
List of Tables	viii
List of Appendices.....	viii
List of Acronyms	viii

Table of contents

Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Background to study	1
1.2 Aims and objectives of the study	3
1.3 Research methodology	3
1.4 An outline of the research	5
Chapter 2 Literature Review	7
2.0 Introduction	7
2.1 Corporate Citizenship in general	8
2.2 Corporate Citizenship in Ecotourism in South Africa	10
2.3 Tourism as a service industry	14
2.4 Impact of tourism on development in South Africa	17
2.5 Job creation	20
2.6 Employment effects	21
2.7 Challenges of the Tourism sector in South Africa	21
2.8 High levels of unemployment in the Eastern Cape	22

2.9 Investment and infrastructural development and its implications	23
2.10 Changes in livelihood with changes in farm activities	24
2.11 Social and political Issues	25
2.12 Tourism Multiplier effects	26
2.13 poverty and the alleviation of unemployment	27
2.14 impact of pro-poor tourism on livelihoods	28
Chapter 3. Research methods	30
3.0 Introduction	30
3.1 Research process	31
3.2 Research paradigm	31
3.3 Qualitative research methodologies	32
3.4 Methodology	34
3.5 Data collection	35
3.6 The use of interviews as a method of data collection	36
3.7 Validity, reliability and transferability in a case study	37
3.8 Ethics in case study research	37
3.9 Data analysis	39
3.10 Constraints	39
3.11 Reflections on the methods used in this case study	41
3.12 Conclusion	42
Chapter 4 Presentation of research results	43
4.1 Introduction	43
4.2 Household history and size	45
4.3 Working history	47
4.4 Education in private game reserves	49
4.5 Medical aid and Education plan	51
4.6 Length of employment	53
4.7 Plans to change jobs	54
4.8 Wages and additional income	55

4.9 Accommodation	58
4.10 Types of housing	59
4.11 Energy resource use	60
4.12 Sources of income	61
4.13 Other income-generating activities	62
4.14 Changes in the conditions of employment	63
4.15 Household Livestock ownership patterns	66
4.16 Dispute resolution	68
4.17 Training opportunities for advancement	68
4.18 The specific nature of work activities	69
4.19 Conclusions	70
Chapter 5 Data analysis and discussion	72
5.0 Introduction	72
5.1 Income and employment	73
5.2 Housing, water, and tenure	78
5.2.1 Housing	78
5.2.2 Water	78
5.2.3 Tenure security	79
5.3 Keeping of livestock	80
5.4 Availability of land for gardening	81
5.5 Accessibility to schools	81
5.6 Land ownership	82
5.7 Discussions	82
5.7.1 Wages	82
5.7.2 Living conditions and livelihood of commercial farm workers	83
5.7.3 Housing on farm	83
5.7.4 Education	84
5.7.5 Training opportunities for future advancement	85
5.8 Conclusions	86

Chapter 6 Conclusions	90
References	93

List of Tables

Table 2- household size

Table 3 - Family history

Table 4- Work status before and after farm conversion (from the employees interviewed)

Table 5 - Education levels for household wage earners [n=15]

Table 6 - Duration of worker employment on farm

Table 7 - Wages and benefits of primary wage earner

Table 8 - showing recommended wage increases for employees

Table 9 - Types of houses found on farms (both commercial and game)

List of Appendices

Appendix A- Questionnaire for Game owners

Appendix B- Research questions for employees and families

List of Acronyms

CC	Corporate Citizenship
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
CTO	Caribbean Tourism Organization
ECARP	East Cape Agricultural Research Project Report
GRI	Global Reporting Initiative
ICLEI	International Council on Local Environmental Initiatives
JSE SRI Index	Johannesburg Stock Exchange Social Responsibility Initiatives
NEPAD	New Partnerships for Africa's Development
OAS	Organization of American States
PGR	Private Game Reserve
UNICEF	United Nations Children Funds
UNCDF	United Nation Capital Development Fund
WTO	World Tourism Organisation

Chapter 1

Context of the research

The research study deals with the corporate citizenship of a private game reserve in the Makana Municipality, with a focus on the rights of previous and current occupants of farms, workers' well-being, job creation and quality of life, among other things.

1.1 Background to study

As defined in the King Report II (2002; 5), “corporate citizenship [includes] the commitment of business to contribute to sustainable economic development, working with employees, their families, the local community and society at large to improve their quality of life”. To meet this definition of corporate citizenship, the companies need to show the steps that they have taken in their attempt to improve the quality of life of their employees and their families.

The government's mandate for innovative and practical approaches to sustainable development is especially urgent in the Eastern Cape Province because of its high poverty levels and threatened natural resource base (Langholz and Kerley, 2006). From a business perspective, the South African economy has, over the past decade, become “stronger, richer and fairer” (Parsons 2004:1). However, South Africa has a high national ‘official’ unemployment rate of 25.6% (Statistics South Africa, 2006) and significant problems associated with poverty. The demise of apartheid in the early 1990s has left South Africa with an indelible social and economic legacy which is characterised by racial division, huge income disparities along racial lines, as well as high levels of crime and violence, especially against women and children. Various efforts have been made to bring about economic regeneration and social reconciliation in South Africa's towns and cities.

According to Langholz and Kerley (2006), despite ongoing expansion of private game reserves in the Eastern Cape, little is known about them. For example, what contributions do/ could they make towards social upliftment in the Eastern Cape? What biological features (plants, animals and landscapes) are they protecting and in what quantities? Are they financially viable enterprises? In an attempt to fill this gap, the Eastern Cape Association of Private Game Reserves (“Indalo”) commissioned an initial study in 2004 of its eight members in the Eastern Cape. This resulted in a report that provided a rare partial snapshot of private game reserves (PGR) in the Eastern Cape (Castley, Boshoff & Kerley, 2004).

The 2004 study provided ground-breaking information that showed that privately owned conserved areas *have the potential* to protect biodiversity, and succeed financially, but there is still the need to ascertain whether these are short-term phenomena or ones that can be sustained over the long term. A follow up study conducted on behalf of Indalo commission in June 2006 indicated that private game reserves provided a “viable” alternative land-use in relation to traditional land use (agriculture) in the Eastern Cape, but still left many questions unanswered. The report recommended that further research be conducted to address the following issues: 1) assessing the full economic impacts of these private game reserves, and 2) regularly updating these socio-economic surveys (Langholz and Kerley, 2006).

Picking up the issues highlighted in these recent studies, this study focuses on the following issues: 1) an assessment of the extent of the corporate citizenship of a particular private game reserves located in the Eastern Cape, in terms of King II, and 2) assess the contribution of the private game reserves to government development goals (in particular, the goal of social upliftment of the communities in PGRs). To understand the impact of the private game reserves on the rural economies and livelihoods, it is important to look at factors such as employment equity policies, benefits enjoyed by employees and their dependents, including the provision of medical aid, pensions, housing, electricity, free water, educational opportunities (Langholz and Kerley, 2006).

1.2 Aims and objectives of the study

The study aims to investigate whether the practices of a particular private game reserve in the Makana Municipality of the Eastern Cape over seven years (from 1999-2006) can justify their being labelled “corporate citizens” as defined by King II.

The objectives of this study are to:

- Look at how the increase of game-based tourism in the Makana Municipality has affected the rights and livelihoods of prior (former farm workers) and current occupants (farm workers) of the farms converted to PGRs.
- Investigate the current workers’ well-being, with a focus on changes in (a) socio-economic status, (b) power relations (conditions of employment and day to day interpersonal relations on the PGR), (c) overall quality of life (through the provision of good housing, fresh water, and so on).
- Investigate whether the increase in tourist numbers and thus revenues has led or is likely to lead to increased job opportunities for the communities living within the game reserves.
- Analyse how the day-to-day livelihoods of selected individuals in the wider farm/PGR worker community changes with the change in farm activities.

1.3 Research methodology

The research was conducted within the interpretive paradigm (Cohen, Morrison and Marion, 2000). This paradigm aims at understanding the subjective experiences of individuals rather than focusing on a mechanistic understanding of human behaviour that is assumed within the positivist paradigm. The approach taken in this dissertation is to use a single case study to examine the extent to which a private game reserve in the Makana Municipality can be regarded as a model “corporate citizen” with special reference to game workers’ livelihoods and conditions of employment.

The case study method is used as this method allows the investigator to concentrate on specific instances in an attempt to identify detailed interactive processes which may be crucial, but which are less visible in a large-scale survey. It provides a three-dimensional picture of the situation (the dimensions illustrated are; relationships, structural political issues and patterns of influence in a particular context) (Remenyi, 1996: 22). Case study research tends to be much more specific in focus, something that might restrict the findings from being generalised more widely (Gray, 2004: 65). A preliminary survey was done and documents were consulted to determine which private game reserve was to be used in the study. Because of the difficulties encountered by the researcher in securing access to private game reserve in Makana Municipality, the decision was taken to conduct as in-depth a study as possible on the only private game reserve where access was possible.

Data were collected using structured interviews, by administering questionnaires consisting of closed and open-ended questions and by consulting and documents from the offices of various provincial government departments. These included the Departments of Agriculture, of Economic Affairs, and Environment & Tourism and, the Department of Labour. These documents were used to investigate the effects of the operations of the private game reserve on the social well-being of the employees (this formed the basis for a triangulation). These interviews and questionnaires were used to uncover the employees' perceptions and experiences of the change from agriculture to private game farming. Key informants included primary wage earners, i.e. the main source of income per household, as well as the reserve manager of the private game reserve.

Ethical issues are important, since the study involves human subjects. The researcher attempted to uphold high ethical standards in conducting this research. The interviewees were made aware of what the study involved, their roles and how the information from the study will be disseminated. The results of the research are to be forwarded to the game reserve management, who in turn will share the information with their workers (the researcher will sanitise what is given back as a report to the management and

interviewees, so that there is no finger pointing at each other). The interviewees were assured of the confidentiality of their contribution, and furthermore, were free to answer only questions that they were comfortable with.

Respondents remain anonymous to promote open and frank responses (this was done by using pseudonyms for both the game reserve and the interviewees) and the management of the game reserve used in the study was assured of feedback on any results obtained, and that they could be a need to verify certain information with them before final print. Permission was sought from the PGR owner for interviews with him and his employees. Copies of the interview guide were supplied to the private game owner and permission for the researcher and interpreter to interview employees during working hours was sought in writing with the offer made by the researcher that a contract be signed between the researcher and PGR owner to pre-empt concerns.

It is anticipated that, even though the sample size is modest, the findings from this study will highlight key areas and issues that might be applicable to other games with similar characteristics.

1.4 An outline of the thesis

Chapter 2 presents an overview of the relevant literature and what various authors have written about on corporate citizenship and tourism, with particular reference to the King II report on corporate citizenship. I will define corporate citizenship according to what various theorists say, and briefly describe how the research came into existence.

In Chapter 3, I describe the research methodology used and why I chose this method and the terms of research paradigm.

In Chapter 4, I present the findings from my questionnaire interviews, which consisted of open-ended and closed questions. Any additional information presented by the interviewees and gathered during interviews was written on the questionnaires.

Chapter 5 deals with discussions of my findings. It also highlights important factors or areas that the game reserve has addressed in their attempt to show their commitment to the well-being of their employees and community.

Chapter 6 will present the conclusion to the study and recommendations for further studies that need to be done, as this study has only scratched the surface in this particular area of corporate citizenship of private game reserves.

Chapter 2

Literature Review

This chapter seeks to examine the following important questions by reference to the existing literature:

- What is corporate citizenship, in relation to corporate social responsibility?
- What issues contribute to a company being labelled 'a corporate citizen'?

In answering these questions, I identify the contribution made by other authors in this field in order to establish measures and principles that can be used to confirm whether the private game reserve could be labelled a 'corporate citizen'. The approach taken in this study will also incorporate an overview of the tourism industry in Southern Africa and, with particular attention being paid to the impact of private game reserves in South Africa.

2.0 Introduction

Welman *et al.* (1994:33) states that "a literature review enables the researcher to thoroughly review the literature dealing with a chosen topic". A literature review sets the scene for a clear formulation of the research problem, as only when the problem is made known, can one begin to investigate it systematically.

The 21st century has opened to a new world. Companies now compete globally for customers as well as talent. As cases like Enron and Anderson show, reputation is as important as the financial outcome. Integrity has become a valuable commodity and it has become clear that companies can no longer simply afford to outsource their conscience. Ian Starnes, Corporate Citizenship Survey, 2002.

2.1 Corporate citizenship in general

Kim (2000: 216) defines corporate citizenship, in composite, as “striving to conduct all business dealings in an ethical manner, making a concerted effort to balance the needs of all stakeholders while working to protect the environment”. The following three issues constitute what this author defines as a good corporate citizen:

1. **Ethical business behavior.** The company is guided by rigorous ethical standards in all of its business dealings.

- 1) Engages in fair and honest business practices in its relationships with stakeholders.
- 2) Sets high standards of behavior for all employees.
- 3) Exercises ethical oversight at the executive and board levels.

2. **Stakeholder commitment.** The company is managed for the benefit of all stakeholders: community, consumers, employees, investors, and suppliers.

- 4) The company is well-managed for all stakeholders.
- 5) Initiates and engages in genuine dialogue with stakeholders.
- 6) Values and implements disclosure.
- 7) Fosters a reciprocal relationship between the corporation and community.
- 8) Invests in the communities in which it operates.
- 9) Respects the rights of consumers.
- 10) Offers quality products and services.
- 11) Provides information that is truthful and useful.

Employee commitment

- 12) Provides a family-friendly work environment.
- 13) Engages in responsible human-resource management.
- 14) Provides an equitable reward and wage system for employees.
- 15) Engages in open and flexible communications with employees.
- 16) Invests in employee development.

Investor commitment

17) Strives for a competitive return on investment.

Supplier commitment

18) Engages in fair trading practices with suppliers

3. **Environmental commitment.** The company moderates its overall environmental impact through programmes such as recycling, waste and emission abatement, and impact assessment via environmental audits (Kim, 2000: 216).

Good corporate citizenship thus encompasses everything a company does that affects the community. Corporate citizenship implies that a company ensures good corporate governance, thereby retaining its solvency within a community. Good corporate citizenship does not always include large-scale philanthropic projects. Whenever a company remains solvent, it retains jobs and benefits for the local area, serving that area as a good citizen. Beyond good governance and solvency, a company, whether it is local, regional, national, or global, voluntarily chooses its CSR projects and the scope of those projects to benefit the community (Kim, 2000: 216).

Increasingly, corporate citizenship is being seen as a core of overall business and a direct responsibility of the board, rather than something confined to the office of the corporate social investment manager. More and more, companies have to become transparent about how they do business whilst operating in a world where anything they do can become public knowledge overnight (Naidoo, 2002)

Corporate citizenship and corporate social responsibility are about the integration of social strategies into the core business of a company so that the existence of those companies will be sustainable in more than just financial terms. Corporate reputation has, however, become as important to the company's share price and its profitability as its finances (Naidoo, 2002)

2.2 Corporate Citizenship in Eco-tourism in South Africa

The United Nations Environmental Protection Programme (UNEP) (2002), in an attempt to define nature-based tourism or eco-tourism as it is known, suggested the following principles; observation and appreciation of nature while respecting traditional cultures; educational; generally small volume locally owned business minimizing impact on the natural and socio-cultural environment; and support for the protection of natural areas. Natural areas are protected by creating economic benefits to host communities and conservation organisations; providing alternative income opportunities for local communities and increasing awareness of natural and cultural assets, among both locals and tourists (Wright, 2005: 28). The White paper on tourism (1996: 19) also outlines the principles for responsible tourism as a “... proactive approach by tourism industry partners to develop market and manage the tourism industry in a responsible manner, so as to create a profit”.

The essence of corporate governance is to ensure that a company is managed in an ethical and responsible way, according to the fundamental principles of fairness, accountability; and transparency. Very importantly in a citizenship context this responsibility extends beyond financial matters to cover non-financial issues across the triple-bottom-line. Good governance also requires a company to identify all risks that are material to the business, including those related to non-financial issues. The King report on Corporate Governance for South Africa, 2002, stepped in with a wide-ranging set of recommendations on corporate governance in this country. In the context of corporate citizenship, King II broke new ground by advocating that a company’s code of corporate governance should embrace what it calls “integrated sustainability reporting on “... the nature and extent of its social, transformation, ethical, safety, health and environmental management policies and practices”. (The Good Corporate Citizenship, 2005:20).

So by definition, good corporate citizenship requires companies to interact with a broad range of stakeholder groups, to consider their needs and to engage them on many

different issues of natural interest. This does not mean that companies should be at the beck-and-call of stakeholders, nor expose themselves to excessive demands of stakeholders, (the Good Corporate Citizen, 2005:94)

Hamann, (2006:176) uses corporate citizenship (CC) as an umbrella term broadly referring to the hope that business is willing and able to contribute to sustainable development. The author expands this reference of corporate citizenship to encompass “the expectation that if companies enhance their engagement with stakeholders, if they assess and manage their social, environmental and economic impacts (the so-called triple-bottom-line), and if they channel some of their capacities for value creation and innovation towards development objectives, then these efforts will make decisive contributions to a better society.”

As Hamann (2006:177) points out, the debate on corporate citizenship is complex because the term is used in such a variety of forms and with diverse intentions, for instance:

- Corporate citizenship as an *object of analysis*; defining the term for the purpose of statistical analysis, with an emphasis on trying to prove a relationship between a company’s social performance and its financial performance;
- Corporate citizenship as a *normative injunction*; literature on the topic claims that business should act responsibly and contribute to development and normative frameworks are provided to guide such behaviour. References are made to the business case, or the expectation that corporate citizenship is good for profit, at least in the medium to long term, but in many instances the explicit or implied message is that abiding by corporate citizenship principles is simply the ‘right thing to do’.
- Corporate citizenship as a *management doctrine*; giving guidelines for big firms as well as a host of smaller companies who do not devote attention to corporate citizenship in some form or other, and providing advice and assurance to these efforts through Global reporting Initiative (GRI). The GRI provides guidance on sustainability reporting.

- Corporate citizenship as an *object of critique*; the critique of CC and related terms argues that it gets in the way of what business is meant to do; making profits. Another critique argues that CC discourse amounts to an attempt by business to legitimise its hegemonic position and to pre-empt more radical changes to the system, particularly in the form of stricter government regulation (Hamann, 2006:178).

Other definitions of corporate citizenship, CSR or related terms

Source	Definition of CC, CSR
Waddock (2003:3)	“Being a good corporate citizen means treating all of a company’s stakeholders (and the natural environment) with dignity and respect, being aware of the company’s impacts on stakeholders; working collaboratively with them when appropriate to achieve mutually desired results”.
WBCSD (2002:2)	“the commitment of business to contribute to sustainable economic development, working with employees, their families, the local community and society at large to improve their quality of life”.
World Economic Forum (www.weforum.org/corporate-citizenship)	“corporate citizenship is about the contribution a company makes to society through its core business activities, its social investment and philanthropy programmes, and its engagement in public policy”

Source: Hamann: 2006:180

In the discourse about sustainable development, the social realm was originally included because of concerns about the equity issues raised by the differences between wealthy, developed countries and poor, less developed countries. With the passage of time, it was recognised that inequities are not limited to wealth and income and, more importantly,

that human well-being was heavily dependent on social relationships and social services (Flynn *et al.*, 2002:92).

This led some theorists to the possibility of treating the economy, environment, and, social realms in an even-handed and logically consistent fashion. Flynn *et al.* (2002: 92) defined sustainability “as a dynamic condition in which the combined economic, environmental, and social systems meet the needs and wants of the current human populations while maintaining or increasing the resources and productive capacities that are passed along to future generations.”

The Johannesburg Stock Exchange (JSE) launched the Social Responsibility Initiatives (SRI) Index in South Africa in May 2004, as a means to identify those companies listed on the JSE that integrate the principles of the triple bottom line into their business activities, and facilitate 'ethical' investment in such companies. The SRI Index has been structured to reflect the complex nature of social sustainability in South Africa, and it identifies the criteria (for example, responsible reporting of social issues) for corporate governance as the foundation on which each of the triple bottom-line should rest (JSE SRI Index, 2004).

The three pillars of the triple bottom-line are: the environment, economy and the society. For the necessarily more limited purposes of this study, it is the corporate social responsibility aspect of the triple bottom-line's *social* sustainability that is considered. According to the SRI requirements, an industry needs to demonstrate the following for it to have integrated corporate social responsibility into its business practices:

- (a) The existence of implemented strategies to promote social upliftment,
- (b) Development and poverty reduction, while taking account of
 - Stakeholder engagement- for decision making
 - Employee awareness and involvement
 - Indigenisation- empowerment and procurement
 - Skill development, literacy
 - Poverty alleviation by means of community projects

- Job creation – entrepreneurs and interns
- Social investment - education, sports, arts and culture.
- Rural development - schools, clinic, services
- Community involvement - assistance, mentoring
- Human rights and
- HIV/Aids support systems (JSE SRI Index, 2004).

The South African model of development is based on an integrated approach to development which is meant to address social and economic needs of communities, whilst ensuring that the natural resources base, upon which life depends, is conserved (Butler and Hallows, 2002).

2.3 Tourism as a service industry

According to the latest domestic tourism survey, the Eastern Cape's tourism industry is on the rise, with some 7.9 million domestic tourism trips (locals going for holidays breaks to game reserves and coastal resorts) made to the Eastern Cape in 2003 compared to 4.3 million in 2001, a gain of 3.6 million (Myles, 2006: 72). However, the province remains one of the poorest provinces in the country.

Employment in the tourism and hospitality sector is generally the most widely recognized contribution to local livelihoods. Enhanced local wages can be the largest, most desired, and most tangible benefit from tourism. Jobs in hotels and guesthouses are widely sought after and despite sometimes poor pay, may be enough to lift a household above the poverty line. But can poor people access these jobs? When they do, what are their conditions of employment? Are they vulnerable to exploitation and do they experience prospects for advancement? What can/might the government departments do to increase the wage flow and enhance working conditions of the rural dwellers? (Ashley, 2006).

By growing the tourism/hospitality sector, tourism companies can contribute to national economic goals without compromising their commercial interests. This will help the

sector to enhance its own security and operating environment. It will also consolidate opportunities and efforts to upgrade the product and enhance the quality of the tourist experience (Ashley, Goodwin, McNab, Scott & Chaves, 2006). There are, however, also negative consequences resulting from international (and national) tourist flows to private game reserves, such as entry price increases for local communities, the leakage of foreign exchange and the establishment of neo-colonial relationships by some multinational enterprises (who own private game reserves) (Roussot, 2005).

Tourism is a leading industry in many developing nations where traditional agricultural production is on the decline (Roussot, 2005). Tourism has been deemed a significant sector and force in the economic regeneration or micro-modernisation of old industrial cities in Western countries (Roche, 1992). In general, South Africa's big sectors such as mining, engineering, tourism, medicine and project management suffer from a significant skills shortage (Roussot, 2005) Tourism has been labelled as an industry that is able to provide primarily skilled and low skilled jobs (Organization of American States (OAS) and the Caribbean Tourism Organisation (CTO), 2005), with the majority of unskilled labour accounting for a third of total employment in the industry.

Tourism can be defined as a labour-intensive service industry that caters for the needs of a specific group of consumers, namely the tourists. The tourism industry can be said to be a true service industry, as defined by Roussot (2005: 65). Some characteristics of the service industries are that:

- Most serve only a limited geographical area.
- Success depends on the quality of services being offered, rather than on large capital investment.
- The cost of labour is the largest operating expense.
- The service rendered is usually of a repeat or maintenance nature: in the case of tourism, it is of a repeat nature.

It therefore has immense employment-generating capacity and also has the ability to create jobs quickly (Opperman and Chon, 1997). The provision of employment-

generating capacity is of primary importance in low developing countries where there are high rates of unemployment and underemployment. Because of the high population growth in developing countries, a number of commentators have listed employment creation as important as the benefit of tourism development to the balance of payment (Opperman and Chon, 1997).

Since the 1980s, the role of tourism as a means of achieving the objectives of the economic development has received prominence within the sustainable development paradigm (Roussot, 2005: 78). Tourism is one of the many external forces influencing the direction and options for local development. The question whether tourism can contribute to local sustainable development is addressed in the context of the local Agenda 21 process mechanisms (International Council on Local Environmental Initiatives (ICLEI), 1999).

The imperative has been expressed for the tourism industry, through both its local and transnational agents to join and support the Local Agenda 21 process mechanisms (ensuring that communities are involved also in tourism projects) in communities where tourism is a fundamental development force (Durban Local Agenda, 1999). A practical discussion on sustainable tourism must take place in and with the communities that are being influenced by the development of the tourism industry (ICLEI, 1999).

The true proof of sustainable tourism will be the sustainable development of local communities that serve as tourist destinations. As stated in the King Report II (2002), “corporate citizenship is the commitment of business to contribute to sustainable economic development, working with employees, their families, the local community and society at large to improve their quality of life”. This part of the proposed code of corporate practices and conduct deals with non-financial reporting and includes the following:

- Stakeholders’ involvement, thus the company’s social and ethical accounting, auditing and reporting.

- Business processes and safety, health and environmental management principles should be integrated and there should be a committed effort to reduce workplace accidents, fatalities and occupational health and safety related incidents.]
- Social and transformation issues, incorporating black economic empowerment as an issue of continuing strategic significance for South African companies. Business practice should meet the requirements of human capital development in areas such as the number of staff, with a particular focus on demographics, gender, people with disabilities, age, corporate training initiatives and employee development (King Report II (2002)).

2.4 Impact of tourism on development in South Africa

Tourism's potential for contributing to economic and social upliftment in Africa is highlighted by the New Partnership for Africa's development (NEPAD). The NEPAD tourism plan (2003:3) states that 'tourism is recognised as one of the sectors with the most potential to contribute to the economic regeneration of the continent, particularly through the diversification of African economies, and generation of foreign exchange earnings (Rogerson, 2007: 362). A large cluster of writings on pro-poor tourism' have provided detailed analysis of tourism's potential for contributing to 'pro-poor growth' and that tourism is presently a key theme in African Poverty Reduction Strategy papers. To achieve the objectives of shared growth through tourism, an important task is the promotion of small and medium sized tourism enterprises. Small and medium sized enterprises represent at least 90% of all tourism enterprises in Africa. South Africa has had great success in promoting small tourism; this has been achieved through Tourism Enterprise Programme which the rest of Africa can emulate. The tourism enterprise programme in South Africa is an example of 'good practice' for the support of small tourism firms (Rogerson, 2007: 371). Further, the role of e-commerce and the internet in providing support for the marketing of small tourism firms is currently receiving much attention.

Studies done by Mahony & van Zyl (2002:99) have shown how different stakeholders- the state, the local community and the private sector- can influence the degree to which tourism investment contributes to rural economic development and can generate new opportunities and benefits for the poor. Although the benefits may be relatively small in absolute terms (in relation to the extent of poverty in these areas), as well as in relative terms (in relation to the benefits accruing to the non-poor), the results from the study demonstrate that communities are, or have, the potential to be significantly better-off than they would have been, had they not been involved in eco-tourism initiatives.

According to Cornelissen (2005: 163), the structural dimension of a country's tourism sector, and in particular the spatial structure of tourism production and consumption relate closely to the nature and extent of the impact that tourism can have. The Western Cape Province, one of South Africa's foremost international tourist regions seeks to use tourism as an instrument of development and socio-economic transformation because of the spatial distributional effects of tourism such as distribution of public and private-sector tourism investments. Yet international experience shows that the purported economic and developmental advantages of tourism which are often ardently claimed by proponents are not automatic, and not without dispute. Tourism has several negative externalities attached to it; it is subject to seasonal fluctuations and high elasticities of demand and can therefore be an unstable source of income and employment. It can also lead to higher inflation and balance-of-payment difficulties in destination countries. There are three structural factors that have been shown to influence the economic impact of tourism, these are: 1) the strength of backward and forward linkages among industries; 2) the ownership structures and patterns that typify the sector, and 3) the spatial features of production and related consumption in a given tourism economy. It is the third factor- the spatial structure of tourism in a given destination- that relates closely to the specific nature of the economic gains that accrue from tourism and also to the extent of its impact in that destination (Cornelissen, 2005: 164)

As was discovered by Allen & Brennan (2004: 4) after their studies of eco-tourism in the Kwazulu-Natal region, despite limitations, eco-tourism can make significant

contributions to the welfare of many impoverished rural communities. The economic impact of tourism can be regarded as both direct and indirect. The direct effect is determined by the actual money spent by tourists at a destination, whereas the indirect effect occurs as a result of subsequent expenditure rounds or complementary spending (Roussot, 2005). South African Tourism (2003) divide tourism into the tourism industry and the tourism economy: the former refers to activities directly serving tourists' needs, whereas the latter takes subsequent expenditure rounds into account via the multiplier process, which will be discussed in later chapters.

The main causes of leakage include foreign ownership, employment of foreigners in key positions, government provision of infrastructure and incentives, and imported materials and food. In view of the high degrees of leakages in many parts of the country, some authors have even suggested that tourism is not a positive force in economic development (Brohman, 1996). Mills and Morrison (in Roussot, 2005: 78) identify a number of sources of leakages of foreign exchange. They are:

- Payment of royalties, profits and dividends.
- The cost of imported goods and services to meet tourists' demands.
- Payment for imported goods and raw materials for the development of infrastructure and buildings.
- Direct expenditure on promotions and publicity.
- Transfer pricing, where payments to multinational corporations are recorded in the tourist-generating country, rather than in the host country.
- Tax exemptions for foreign-owned companies and other financial inducements used to attract foreign investments.

If leakages are not stemmed, or at least reduced, tourism cannot lead to sustained economic growth that will benefit local communities.

According to Vellas and Becherel (1995), the arguments against mass tourism should not be on its effect on the balance of payment, but on the large leakages associated with mass tourism, where tourists are often not prepared to accept products that they are not

accustomed to, so leakages tend to be large in small countries dominated by enclave resort development (Vellas and Becherel, 1995).

2.5 Job creation

This is another important indicator of economic size. Game ranching can potentially provide employment for all sectors of the community. Aylward and Lutz (2002:296) estimated that 5,500 jobs are generated from foreign hunting in South Africa, with an average of 7-8 people employed per safari operator. In total, approximately 49 000 jobs were created on privately owned game reserves in the country, with an average of 7 employees per reserve. According to Kirsten and Rogerson (2002:30) the ability of the tourism sector to contribute significantly to employment creation and entrepreneurship development is, however, crucially dependent on a number of variables including, *inter alia*, the nature and location of the tourism project, the size and source of investment, the policy intentions (if any) accompanying the investment and the level of support available to entrepreneurs are favourable.

There is evidence to suggest that indirect job creation may be for highly-skilled workers who are well rewarded, provided that there are employees available to fill these positions. The counter-argument to this premise is that tourism is a lucrative industry that is able to aid development through job creation (Roussot, 2005: 78). O'Grady (1980 in Roussot, 2005: 78), argues that the proportion of a country's labour force that can be accommodated through job provision in the tourism industry is small. In Kenya, tourism is the second largest foreign exchange earner, yet it represents only 8 percent of the country's total employment (Roussot, 2005:78). In Nepal it was estimated that tourism employed 0.2 percent of the labour force in 1977, but it required 3 times as much investment to create a tourism job as it did to create a job in the manufacturing sector (Belk, 1993)

2.6 Employment effects

The type of employment that can be created through tourism can be classified as direct jobs, indirect jobs and induced jobs. The three levels at which tourism can impact on employment are:

- Direct employment through the employment of staff for the upkeep of lodges, and as shop assistants in their handcraft curio shops, or tourism attractions that employ people directly.
- Indirect employments in businesses that are affected by tourism in a secondary way, such as local transport, handcraft businesses and banks.
- Investment employment generated through the construction of large infrastructural works, such as airports, roads, electricity networks, water reticulation and sanitation works (De Kadt, 1989)

The employment effect of tourism development is, however, subject to leakages caused by foreign investment in the tourism industry, similar to that discussed above. These leakages result, not only from the foreign ownership of enterprises, but because of the employment of foreigners in key positions. This does not imply that tourism lacks the capacity to employ locals. The extent to which tourism is able to provide job opportunities for the local population depends on the following:

- The extent to which employees are from outside the area, such that if greater use is made of migrant labour, then less opportunities will be created for the local labour force.
- The type of employment required by the tourism sector, which will be determined by the seasonality of the tourist sector and the type of tourist activities in a particular area (Bulls, 1995)

2.7 Challenges of the Tourism sector in South Africa

Although it has been argued that “the South African economy has, over the past decade, become stronger, richer and fairer” (Parsons 2004:1), South Africa has a high

unemployment rate of 25.6 % (Statistics South Africa, 2006) and significant problems associated with poverty. The most pressing problem facing South Africa today is the absence of sustained economic growth and job creation, which are essential to reduce poverty and improve living conditions.

The transition to a non-racial democracy in 1994 posed difficult political, social, and economic challenges, and South Africa's noteworthy achievements in surmounting these challenges have been widely recognised. But the events of last few years demonstrate clearly that the challenge did not end with the transition of power to a new government. What lies ahead is the daunting task of ensuring that South Africa's rich natural and human resources are employed for the benefit of all, promoting sustainable livelihoods, improving social conditions, and alleviating poverty (Lewis, 2001:8).

Since South Africa's transition to democracy, international tourist numbers have increased considerably and the country has become the most popular tourist destination in Africa (Roussot, 2005). It is therefore important to study the implication of these changes in land use on the social well-being of the communities affected by such development in tourism with special reference to improvements in job opportunities, poverty-alleviation and quality of life. As Rogerson (2003) points out, the various policy measures introduced by the government to assist historically disadvantaged individuals have made South Africa an international leader and innovator in developing the practises and applications of pro-poor tourism, especially since 95 percent of the tourism economy in South Africa is considered to be white-owned. These various policies and measures are meant to address the social aspect of the triple bottom line.

2.8 High levels of unemployment in the Eastern Cape

The Eastern Cape is currently one of the poorest provinces in SA, with 70% of its 6.2 million habitants classified as poor. It also shows the highest unemployment rate of 48.5% (Statistical South Africa, Rural Survey, 1997). As a result, a large number of households rely on pensions (40%) or remittances (23%) to eke out a poor livelihood.

Poverty in this province is deeply entrenched, with 27% of households earning less than R400 per month when the poverty line is estimated as R650 for a household of 4.5 people. In many instances, because of their low levels of education, locals are employed in semi-skilled and unskilled positions, because local communities are not always afforded the opportunity to acquire training that will enable them to compete against other trained personal for managerial positions (Opperman and Chon, 1997). And because of this, locals can be employed only in low paying positions and are never afforded the opportunities of being managers where the income is higher.

In many instances there is a high demand for semi-skilled and unskilled workers in the tourism industry (Myles and Mullins, 1993). The authors estimate that 75 percent of all employees in the international tourist industry are semi-skilled. Such a scenario provides hope for low developing (undeveloped) countries, where much of the labour force falls within the 'unskilled' category as a result of low levels of education and minimal access to skills training (Myles and Mullins, 1993).

2.9 Investment and infrastructural development and its implications

The development of a tourism infrastructure has the potential to benefit the local community (Roussot, 2005) and some of the benefits of tourism development can be transferred from areas where incomes are earned in primary and secondary industries, such as mining and manufacturing. The local impacts of the tourism industry are diverse and are often unique to the tourism sector. Tourist activities, as traditionally defined by the tourism industry, fundamentally involve the transportation and hosting of the tourism consumer in a local community, i.e. the 'tourist destination' where the tourist product is consumed (ICLEI, 1999).

Studies so far have shown that tourist activities produce unique social impacts upon the local tourist community, such as the interruption of local customs and lifestyles, the spread of infectious diseases, changes in local demographics, and changes in local housing and labor markets. According to South African Tourism (2005), the increase in

the number of jobs created in the economy (direct and indirect) was 3.5%, from 1 024 520 in 2004 to 1 055 880 in 2005. International tourists increased to 10.3% over 2004, from 6 677 000 to 7 369 000 in 2005. The tourism and recreation industry is increasingly recognised as an important economic, environmental and social force which can bring both benefit and adversity (Jones, 1999).

The political drive to encourage the tourism industry derives from its potential for generating employment in an area threatened to a new degree by persistent unemployment. However, while tourism may be a sector where relatively high levels of employment can be generated, doubts are often expressed about the low quality of this employment and about economic strategies which do not appear to be capable of generating 'real' jobs (Roche, 1992).

A key element of a successful tourism industry is the ability to recognise and deal with change across a wide range of behavioural and technological factors and the way they interact. Community interest and tourism must work together for any chance of long-term success. In the long term, it is not useful to have isolated tourist enclaves. The most rewarding forms of tourism, both in terms of the visitor and resident experiences and the economic viability to the developer, are those that involve both residents and tourists.

2.10 Changes in livelihood with changes in farm activities

Since the income from tourism is assumed to be higher than what rural people can earn from agriculture, tourism has been accepted willingly in many rural areas in spite of its potentially negative effects. Rural unemployment rates are often said to exceed 50% and given the lack of alternative opportunities, all the new jobs would be highly valued (Ashley, 2006). However, poorly planned tourism can mean that villages are 'invaded' or commoditized by foreign visitors with different values, disrupting rural culture. A decline in participation in rural traditional and cultural practices may follow. Traditional houses are replaced by modern buildings, as the local culture is eroded. This is highlighted by

the changes in the social well-being of the community, and, the effect on the environment, through the increase in the number of visitors (Jones, 1999).

2.11 Social and Political Issues

A stream of writings has called for greater attention to social and political issues in protected areas' establishment and operation world wide (Langholz and Lassoie, 2001: 1083). The general idea behind such people-orientated perspectives is that since local residence affect (and are affected by) parks more than anyone else; they should have a major voice in resource use decisions. Privately-owned parks overlap with two of these important social and political conservation themes – devolution of resource control and public participation in resource decision making. In countries such as Colombia, the surge in private reserves has been closely linked to empowerment, representing a step toward to devolution of resource control to rural people. Private reserves can also represent an extreme form of participation in protected area management. Local residents who own reserves control decision making instead of merely seeking to participate in it (Langholz and Lassoie, 2001: 1083).

The first major pitfall of private game reserves is that they can become islands of the elite, places where wealthy landowners host affluent tourists. It is crucial that reserves develop meaningful links to surrounding communities through providing employment and other activities, while also assisting with the building of schools, constructing of roads and so on. The second problem lies with Private Parks' contribution to the concentration of land ownership by the wealthy. Brinkate (1996 in Langholz and Lassoie, 2001), in a study of the land in South Africa, revealed that wealthy landowners declared their lands to be conservation areas in order to avoid government and redistribution schemes. In such cases, private reserves can become flashpoints where the broadly supported goals of social justice are at odds with strategies for private accumulation.

A final social issue lies with foreign ownership of private reserves. Alderman (1994; Langholz and Lassoie, 2001; 1083), has found that 33% of reserves in Africa are exclusively foreign-owned, with an additional 7% jointly owned by nationals and

foreigners. Although nationals own the majority of private reserves in developing countries, a large foreign presence can be disturbing to those who consider it an land grab or a subtle form of neo-colonialism (Langholz and Lassoie, 2001; 1083).

2.12 Tourism Multiplier effects

The employment of locals at low wage levels is said to impact negatively on the employment and income multipliers. These multiplier estimates refer to the additional employment or income that is generated in a particular region as a result of tourist expenditure (Tribe, 1995). Tourism multipliers are used to determine the effects of tourism expenditure on economic variables. The employment multiplier measures the total extra employment that results from tourism employment generated through additional tourist arrivals (Bulls, 1995). According to a study done by Sims-Castley, Kerley and Geach (2004), PGRs created several multiplier effects in the Eastern Cape region economy and Langholz and Kerley (2006), in their follow up study highlighted the following five:

- First, visitors to PGRs make other expenditures in the Eastern Cape. These include buying crafts, staying in hotels, purchasing clothes, renting cars, visiting other attractions, and dining in restaurants (Geach 2002). Therefore, ecotourists' true economic impact is much wider than what is spent at the PGRs. Assuming a 70% multiplier effect documented by the Namibian Department of Environment and Tourism and cited in Humavindu & Barnes (in Langholz and Kerley, 2006), the R105.8 million in revenue generated by private game reserves in 2004/2005 translates into a total infusion of R179.9 million into the regional economy.
- Second, PGRs' presence increases the diversity of attractions in the Eastern Cape. This encourages tourists to stay longer in the province, thus increasing their impact in the region.

- Third, PGRs diversify the rural economy. Agriculture has long dominated the Eastern Cape, but has proven to be unstable and on the decline.
- Fourth, PGRs increase land values. Instead of local land owners selling their to stock farmers for only R700/ha, land owners can sell for more than twice that amount, so the presence of private game reserves allows local owners to reap the benefits of significant real estate appreciation (Geach 2002).
- Fifth, PGRs support family members who are not directly employed by the reserve through being hired seasonally and as contract workers. According to Langholz and Kerley (2006), private game reserves provided estimates regarding full-time employees who serve as the primary wage earners in their families to be 107, and the primary wage earner in this case is defined as the main source of income. These primary wage earners are estimated to support anywhere from 4 to 7 family members each (median of 4.5). And one point to note in this scenario is that these numbers do not include dependants who may be partially supported by seasonal or contract workers.

Tourism multipliers measure the secondary impact of tourism expenditure on an economy. For broad-based development to occur, strong linkages between the tourism sector and the rest of the economy have to be developed. This will increase the income and employment-generating capacity of the sector (Brohman, 1996) and tourism can generate considerable indirect employment in agriculture, food processing and a range of light manufacturing industries.

2.13 Poverty and the alleviation of unemployment

Through the multiplier effect of investment in the Eastern Cape, the increase in the number of tourists has a bearing on job opportunities and enhanced natural resource use and waste management. From the observations made by Dearden (1991), most of the community income is derived from three main categories: handicrafts, miscellaneous

services, and begging. No attempt has ever been made to calculate the last category, because of wide variability and the difficulty in obtaining data. Handicrafts are another source of income for the community as accommodation is the prerogative of the game-reserve owners. Furthermore, income is derived from providing miscellaneous services such as portage, performance of dances, and posing for photographs in traditional outfits and as locals learn that their traditional dress is worth cash, so they may sell it (Jones, 1999). According to Dieke (2000), however, local people have been able to benefit from tourism by selling goods and services that favour tourism expansion.

2.14 Impact of pro-poor tourism on livelihoods

Ashley & Haysom (2006:265) define pro-poor tourism as “managing a tourism business so that it makes business sense for the operator and at the same time benefits the poor”. The case being argued being that ‘mainstream’ commercial tourism can do much to embrace pro-poor approaches, and in particular, the tourism sector needs to go further in shifting from philanthropic approaches to pro-poor approaches that entail rethinking business structures. Ashley & Roe (2002:62) define pro-poor tourism as tourism that generate net benefits for the poor, and the authors go on to state that it is not a specific sector or product. Benefits in this case may be economic but they may also be social, environmental or cultural, and affect livelihoods in multiple indirect ways.

Poverty as stated by Ashley and Roe (2002:73) is not only a matter of lack of income. The poor often suffer vulnerability, ill-health, and lack of opportunity, disrespect and limited access to public and private assets. From studies done by Ashley and Roe (2002:73), there has been significant impacts on human, physical and financial capital as a result of applying pro-poor tourism, most notably have been the positive impacts on skills, education and health through training, funding for school and clinics, and investment in health care. Pro-poor tourism appears to impact positively at the local level, resulting in an increase in livelihood security as a result of increased wage income, better access to infrastructure and information. Although many of those involved remain poor, they are better off than before (Ashley and Roe, 2002:73)

Most of the literature deals with issues related to economic and environmental sustainability on a broad scale and only scratch the surface of issues that deal with social sustainability in the tourism industry and in line with the Millennium Developmental Goals (such as poverty alleviation; health for all by 2020; employment creation etc). It is important to show how the increase in the number of tourists that visit the Eastern Cape impacts on the local community. Game parks have been identified as a site for kick-starting local entrepreneurial initiatives in an effort to change the balance of economic power to historically disadvantaged individuals and the poor in rural areas (Page, 1999).

To understand the impact of the private game reserves on the rural economies and livelihood it is important to look at other factors such as changes in income level, trends in job opportunities, benefits to employee dependents, medical aid, pensions, free water, funeral plan and unemployment (Langholz and Kerley, 2006).

Chapter 3: Research methods

3.0 Introduction

This chapter provides an explanation of how the investigation was conducted. In doing so, the chapter discusses the research design and methodological steps employed in the investigation. The discussion of the research design covers the methods of data collection, the relevant processing tools and how the data were captured, consolidated and interpreted.

The tools I employed for the data gathering include: a review of the relevant literature, in-depth interviews (face-to-face), the administering of a questionnaire survey, participant observation and document analysis from a diversity of sources, which include the Department of Labour, an NGO known as the East Cape Agricultural Research Project, the Department of Agriculture and media reports. In essence, the approach taken in this dissertation was to examine to what extent the private game reserves in the Makana Municipality can be labelled as model ‘corporate citizens’ with special reference to livelihood of workers and this was done by means of a single case study of one PGR.

I review the defining features of qualitative research methodology and discuss the reasons for adopting qualitative instruments for data gathering and analysis (Hartley & Muhit, 2003:103). Because of the nature of my research questions (which do not require ‘Yes or No’ answers only), I adopted qualitative research methods. This is because qualitative methods have the ability to take the researcher “into the minds and lives” of the people affected by the shift from commercial agriculture to private game farming (McCracken, 1988:10). The chapter also highlights some of the limitations of the research tools I used. Towards the end of the chapter I discuss some of the ethical issues guiding this research (Rubin & Babbie, 1997:364).

3.1 Research process

The three pillars of the triple bottom-line are: the environment, economy and society, and for the purpose of this study, the project is addressing the *corporate social responsibility* aspect of the triple bottom-line's three pillars. Since, according to the King II report (2002) corporate citizenship is the commitment of business to contribute to sustainable economic development, working with employees, their families, the local community and society at large to improve their quality; I identified the following key issues:

- Investigate how the increase of game-based tourism in the Makana Municipality has affected the status and livelihoods of prior and current occupants of the farms (farm workers) converted to PGRs.
- Investigate the current workers' well-being, with a focus on changes in (a) socio-economic status, (b) power relations (conditions of employment and day-to-day interpersonal relations on the PGRs), (c) overall quality of life (acceptable housing, availability of fresh water, etc).
- Determine whether the increase in tourist numbers and thus revenues has led or is likely to lead to increased job opportunities for the farm/ PGR worker community.
- Observe how the day-to-day livelihoods of selected individuals in the wider farm/PGR worker community changes with the change in farm activities

3.2 Research paradigm

The research was conducted within the interpretive and inductive paradigm (Cohen, Marion & Morrison, 2000). This paradigm aims to understand the subjective experiences of individuals rather than focusing on a more mechanistic understanding of human behaviour which is assumed within the positivist paradigm. Van Rensburg (2001:16) notes that an interpretive research is "interested in the meaning that people make of phenomena".

Multiple methods were used to try to capture as much of the reality of the research situation as possible. Multiple methods "are needed to generate and test theory, [and] improve understanding over time of how the world operates" (Patton, 2002:92). Several

different sources of information were used for the process called data triangulation to increase the accuracy and reliability of the findings. This was done by collecting information from multiple sources with the aim of corroborating the same fact or phenomenon (Yin, 2003: 98-99). The research reflects a belief that absolute objectivity is impossible to achieve, but that it is worth striving for (Patton, 2002). Also Van Rensburg (2001:17) claims that “interpretive researchers are often not that interested in taking action through or even after their research; their focus is on unravelling the complexities of social life as they and the research participants experience it”. The research design falls within the domain of the above statement and furthermore, reflects an interest in contextual meaning-making and conceptual understanding, rather than generated rules. The research looked for rich, detailed information of a qualitative nature through in-depth questionnaires, document analysis, using literature reviews and an interview.

3.3 Qualitative research methodologies

Because of the nature of the research questions this study seeks to answer, a qualitative research methodology was employed. Quantitative methods such as large surveys and questionnaires that make use of random samples would not have been the most appropriate tools to collect this information. My aim in this project was not to quantify answers. Instead I wanted to go beyond numbers and generalizations and engage people. The qualitative aspect of the interpretive paradigm is appropriate to the current research because it seeks to interpret a social phenomenon in a natural setting in which people’s experiences, views, behaviours, actions and knowledge are gathered from interviews, observations and different types of documents (Merriam, 2001:56). The characteristics and fine points of case studies have been covered to a large extent by well known authors such as Cohen, Marion, and Morison (2000). Some of the features of case studies found in literature that suited my research were: (a) a single case set within certain boundaries; (b) an integrated system; (c) the processual nature of the subject under study.

The term qualitative research can refer to many different ways of conducting research. But for the purpose of my study I adopted a working definition provided by Denzin and Lincoln (2003:3). According to these authors, qualitative research refers to:

“...a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. It consists of a set of interpretive, material practices that make the world visible. These practices turn the world into a series of representations including field notes, interviews, conversations, photographs, recordings and memos to the self. At this level, qualitative research involves an interpretive, naturalistic approach to the world. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret phenomena in term of meanings people bring to them” (Denzin & Lincoln, 2003:3).

This definition is adopted because of its usefulness in highlighting the methodological foundations that characterise qualitative studies. These include the fact that my study was situated in a particular location, which is the private game reserve close to Grahamstown where I conducted the study. This definition is also relevant because it places emphasis on the interpretive nature of my study and it stresses that qualitative research takes place in everyday situations (see below). Silverman (1993:170) contends that qualitative research is “especially interested in how ordinary people observe and describe their lives”.

Instead of relying on sources to inform us about what happened, as qualitative researchers, our aim is to study a slice of events as they happen in the field. It is for this reason that this method is also known as ‘naturalistic inquiry’ and ‘field research’. The study of participants’ behaviour and actions in a natural setting allows the qualitative researcher to capture the “normal course of events” and certainly to “observe events and actions as they happen” (Babbie & Mouton, 2001:271). A further characteristic of qualitative research is that it is normally conducted in a relatively unstructured and flexible manner (Struwig & Stead, 2001:13). In collecting data for this project, I followed an unstructured approach with “a list of topics or issues, (themes) that was covered. The phrasing and sequencing of questions varied from interview to interview” (Bryman, 2001:509).

The case study method was used in this study as it allows the investigator to concentrate on specific instances in an attempt to identify detailed interactive processes which may be crucial, but which are less visible in a large scale survey. It provides a three-dimensional

picture of the situation, thus it can better illustrate relationships, structural political issues and patterns of influence in a particular context (Remenyi, 1996:22).

Case study research tends to be much more specific in focus, however, this aspect may restrict the findings from being generalised more widely (Gray, 2004). Patton (2001) observes that case studies are useful where one needs to understand a particular group of people, problem or situation in great depth. He further explains that a qualitative case study not only seeks to describe units in depth, but brings out the issue of context and history of the particular issue under investigation.

3.4 Methodology

Methodology is usually employed to indicate the conceptual and philosophical assumptions that justify the use of particular research methods. Methodology helps us to understand not only the products of scientific inquiry, but also the process itself (Winston, 1995:38). Methodology entails the whole process of carrying out a study, and is aimed at understanding a social phenomenon (Creswell, 1994:2). According to Saunders (1997:3), research methodology “involves a multistage process which one follows in order to undertake and complete the research project” The stages that I followed in this project included: topic formulation, literature review, design, data collection, data analysis and reporting of the findings.

This research is a case study: studying a private game reserve near to Grahamstown, in the Eastern Cape, and focusing on the description and analysis of patterns and relationships within the context of the farm workers' well being. It is important to note that the PGR studied was the only one that allowed the researcher to conduct the research at the level of detail required for a study of this nature. I am thus using this PGR as a single case-study and as a representative of what is likely to be found in other private game reserves that have shifted from being a commercial agricultural area to private game reserve.

My interest here is to examine the processes undertaken by the private game reserves in trying to address the issues of change in social status, quality of life and improved well-being of their employees and communities around them. The use of a single case study may be criticised, but in the context of the difficulties of access to the other nine PGRs in the Makana Municipality, this was the only course of action open to me.

3.5 Data collection

For the purpose of this study, open and closed ended questionnaires were used in a focused interview. In this case a respondent was interviewed for a short period of time, roughly 30 minutes. The study included documentation from secondary sources, principally the Departments of Agriculture (Eastern Cape), Department of Economic Affairs, Environment & Tourism, East Cape Agricultural Research Project (ECARP), Department of Labour and other published and ‘grey’ literature sources, to investigate the effects of the operations of private game reserves on the social well-being of the communities affected.

When I visited ECARP, I reached an agreement with the director of research that I would provide them with my raw data after the dissertation in exchange for information on private game reserves that they had collected. This NGO has done extensive research into the lives and working conditions of farm workers, ranging from those who were affected by the shift of their farms from agricultural to game farming and how this led to some worker losing their jobs. ECARP also studied the specific private game reserve focused on in this dissertation. Information provided by ECARP included journals on labour and wages issues among others, which is very important to this study, as part of investigation of this study involves examining wages, housing, quality of life and employment.

The Department of Labour provided the researcher with information on wages for workers in the hospitality sector per hour and per month. The researcher also requested information on trends in wages changes since post- 1994, but this was not possible due to red tape and lack of coordination within the department. This information was important

because it would have shown the trends in wages changes and their significance to the well being of the farm workers. Part of the information on wages the researcher received from the supervisor. The Department of Economic Affairs, Environment & Tourism provided the researcher with the list of names of private game reserves managers who could be contacted at the initial stage of the research. Without these names and contact details the whole exercise would have been futile. Other information collected includes the Indalo Commission research on its members (the 13 game reserves in the Eastern Cape), technical papers from Pro-poor Tourism reports and text, among others; including unpublished PhD and Honours paper from Rhodes University.

3.6 The use of interviews as a method of data collection

Interviews were used as the main data gathering tool. This research could have used another type of interview that entails more structured questions: the survey. Such a survey could be designed as part of a case study and produce quantitative data as part of the case study evidence. Due to the problems the researcher encountered during the period of seeking permission for the private game reserves, leading to time constraints and increased costs, the researcher ended up relying on the administering of questionnaires. It took the researcher over eight months to get responses from reserve owners, as most of them were adamant that my research was too sensitive and was meant to expose them.

This was communicated back to the business school, who, in their effort to help me gain access, drafted a letter to this effect (seeking permission to carry out the research at the private game reserves) but this did not shift things. It was only in July 2007 (after having started in December 2006), that one private game reserve agreed to let me gain access their reserve, after relentless efforts to conduct the survey. Here I finally conducted my interviews as this was during the National Arts Festival and most these areas are busy entertaining foreign visitors who come for this once-off event that takes place in July each year.

This study was self-sponsored and the costs incurred in sending faxes, making telephones calls through cell phones and land line were beyond the researcher's means. So this researcher chose to use a focused interview method where the respondent is interviewed in short period, without the use of a recorder. As the researcher was unable to converse in the mother language of most respondents (isiXhosa), the researcher used an interpreter.

3.7 Validity, reliability and Transferability in a case study

This is the extent to which the research findings represent what is actually going on in a particular situation. There are high levels of validity in a case study, as the data are rich in their 'explanations and analysis' and the aim was to capture the experiences and feelings of the communities in their natural settings (Hussey and Hussey, 1997: 57-59).

If a later researcher followed the same procedure and conducted the same case study, then the outcomes of the research should be similar (Yin, 1994: 36). Questionnaires used in this research have been filed, so that future researchers can use these data sheets and this would ensure that the reliability of the findings can be verified and the authenticity established (Perakyala, 1997:203)

3.8 Ethics in case study research

Ethical issues are important since the study involves human subjects. In particular, with the use of in-depth, structured nature of qualitative research and the fact that it raises issues that are not always anticipated, mean that ethical considerations have a particular resonance in qualitative research studies (Lewis, 2003:66). Because of the sensitivity of the issues involved in the subject of housing, wages and living conditions, the researcher ensured that the anonymity and confidentiality of all participants would be maintained at all times (Babbie & Mouton, 2001:527). This was achieved by being explicit about the use of the names of my informants on the questionnaire or interview schedule (using pseudonyms), so that no information or opinions volunteered by the participants could be attributed to them or their household. Even though I wrote down their names and that of

their families, to promote open and frank responses I informed the community that their details would remain anonymous.. I, as the researcher was going to be the only one who will know their names but if the raw data could be given to another researcher, their names would be deleted or pseudonyms used in the place of original names. The private game reserve has one hundred and forty one employees (141) and out of these, sixteen employees were interviewed.

For the purpose of obtaining participant feedback on the plausibility of the study for ethical reasons I followed Seidman's (1991:54) suggestion to make the entire report available to the participants, who then had with the opportunity to point out anything in the document that they were uncomfortable with or that they feel is inaccurate or unfair.

Permission to interview the sixteen (16) workers was secured by informing the participants about the purpose of methods for data collection, and the intended and possible uses of the data. The researcher realized that by nature, human beings – when they participate in a research project – tend to react differently to being asked to reveal how they feel about certain issues that may jeopardise their work. For example, some may be relaxed, while other may be more anxious about being interviewed, supply inaccurate information, and deliberately attempt to misinform the researcher (Mouton & Marais, 1990:76). To reduce the impact of these reactive phenomena, the researcher made a serious attempt to build relationships of trust with the participants and this made them comfortable during the actual interviews. What also helped the researcher was the fact that I selected interviewees ad hoc. There was no system or format used. The interviewees were interviewed at their work place as it was a busy time (the National Festival), so the researcher simply hand-picked a few workers, and the interview was done out of the earshot of any superiors, thus helping to assure them that what ever was said would remain confidential.

The management of the game reserve used in this study was assured of feedback on any results obtained as they were interviewed as well, and I entered into an agreement with them that there maybe a need to verify certain information with them before final print.

Permission was sought from the PGR owner for an interview with him and his employees. In order to show transparency, I sent copies of the questionnaires that were going to be used for the interview to the private game reserve owner in advance. Permission for the researcher and interpreter to interview employees during working hours was sought in writing and the researcher agreed to sign a written contract, if needed, to pre-empt any concerns.

3.9 Data analysis

Data were analysed using two methods: identifying themes and coding the data. According to Kelly (1999:143) “coding means breaking up the data in analytical relevant ways. This entails making different sections of the data as being instances of, or relevant to, one or more of one’s themes”. The researcher coded phrases, lines, sentences and paragraphs. The Chi-square statistical method is used. This is a statistical test that establishes whether the observed frequencies correspond with the expected frequency. Key informants included primary wage earners, i.e. the main source of income per household, as well as the reserve manager of the sample private game reserve selected.

3.10 Constraints

At the start of the study, financial and time constraints informed the researcher’s decision to restrict the study to three locations within the Makana Municipality. As mentioned earlier, the researcher experienced problems with the owners of the private game reserves who had been selected, as most of them apparently assumed that the research was designed to cast them and their labour practices in a negative light. The researcher does acknowledge the sensitivity of the study, but it was not intended to expose anyone. Initially, letters that introduced the study were faxed to 10 private game reserve owners and only two responded confirming receipt of the request. The researcher then resorted to telephoning the reserve owners, in order to explain the aim of the study and what it involved. This followed an earlier round in which PGR owners were sent copies of my research proposals, explaining what the study was all about. This (the research proposal)

shed some light, as mentioned earlier and it seemed promising as I was asked to submit my research proposal and research questionnaires again.

After complying with their request, three owners seemed willing to participate in the study, but when it came to confirming interview dates and time, two private game reserve owners developed cold feet and refused to grant me permission to interview their workers. I tried another approach, which was to find some of the board members of these game farms, hoping that through them I could apply leverage on the reserve manager, but all these attempts came to nought, as even they could not help. After several months of negotiations, with time running out, one game reserve owner relented and gave me permission to interview the owner himself and his employees.

This sequence of events affected the population and sample size of the research and pointed to some of the challenges of conducting what is construed as 'sensitive' research around labour issues in a competitive business environment. Apart from affecting the researcher's population and sample size, this also affected the time that I ended up allocating to each interview and the number of times interviews that could be conducted. Under these circumstances, sampling size ceased to be a critical issue and also because now I was dealing with a single study, my research methodology design had to be adjusted to suit that of a single case study.

The research was greatly affected by these sequences of event and as a result it was conducted over a short time at a point when one specific game reserve was going through the shift from commercial farming to game farming. The study is thus a snapshot of change over time and thus limited in its predictive and even interpretive value. My use of an interpreter to help with the translation from English to IsiXhosa, limited my ability to understand the nuances of what my respondents were telling me.

The time of the year as mentioned earlier, meant that the game reserves had many visitors to their places, so most people were busier than usual and thus not able to give me as much time during interviews as I would have liked.

I resorted to using information from other studies done on other private game reserves in the area to support my findings. An element of racism did play a role as most of the earlier studies had been done by white researchers and they had apparently experienced no problems getting access to the reserves to conduct their research. These are my conclusions based on my personal experience and I stand by them.

3.11 Reflection on the methods used in this study

Qualitative researchers recognise and acknowledge challenges inherent in their studies, such as subjectivity and its complexities, when observing people's expressions in the interpretative paradigm. The research used documentation, interviews and literature from other findings, but this is not to say these methods do not have weakness. Using documentation can bring problems of accessibility and reporting bias. This is because many organisations prefer to maintain confidentiality. This the researcher experienced from the Department of Labour, where the officials could not provide written information on wages for farm workers, but instead insisted that I write them in my notebook as it was read out from their computers. The method has its strengths, though, in that it is:

- stable, thus documents can be reviewed repeatedly
- unobtrusive, as it is not created as a result of interviews or other interactions with people
- exact, as it contains precise details of names, positions, and events
- Offers broad coverage, covering a long span of time, events and settings. (Gray, 2004: 135)

The researcher conducted interviews (face to face) with the game reserve manager and his employees, who were selected per site visited. The workers were working on different sites 5-10km apart, so per site; for example, out of 10 workers the researcher would select three workers. There are two types of sampling selection criterion that I could use: purposeful sampling or purposive sampling. In purposive sampling, subjects are selected by the researcher to obtain a sample that appears to be representative of the group

(Patton, 1990). So the researcher chooses the interviewees according to the number of people who would be representative of the group at the site. The inherent dangers of interviews are noted. The likelihood of responses to interviews being biased due to poorly constructed questions; response bias; inaccuracies due to poor recall and reflexivity, here the interviewee gives what interviewer wants to hear (the responses may not reflect the real situation) is an area of concern that needs to be taken in account by the researcher.

3.12 Conclusion

This chapter described the methods used to gather data for this project. The emphasis was placed on describing the advantages of adopting qualitative research methods. Both primary and secondary sources were used in collecting data for this project. Problems and constraints encountered in the field were also highlighted. It is anticipated that, even though the sample size was modest, the findings from this study will highlight key areas and issues that might well be applicable to other game reserves with similar characteristics.

This chapter also highlighted the reasons why one private game reserve was chosen for study. Lastly, the philosophical assumptions of qualitative research were discussed as a way of showing how individuals understand and interpret their social actions. In the following chapter, I turn to examine the findings of the research I undertook on the game reserve. The private game reserve will be referred to as “Mtshelazi game reserve”, which means the researcher will not mention its location or indicate it on a map, as this would reveal the identity of the place.

Chapter 4- Presentation of research results

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents in detail the research findings from the fieldwork conducted at Mtshelazi game reserve. This fieldwork included the administering of a questionnaire survey to a sample of 15 households. The researcher used a focused, open and closed ended structured questionnaire during the interview. The process of interviewing the game owner and sixteen employees took over six hours to complete. The household is used as the primary social unit of analysis and the wage earner as the employee, thus trying to address the issue underpinning this project, i.e. are private game reserves committed to the well-being of their employees and the community around the work? The approach taken here is to compare the employment and general living conditions of workers and farm dwellers before and after the establishment of this particular private game reserve (PGR). The areas that are deemed to be most important in this regard are (i) employment history (ii) educational opportunities, training availability for future development, (iii) livestock keeping, housing and water availability, sources of energy used and (iv) previous working and living conditions. In this chapter, information gathered during fieldwork is presented sequentially on each of these key issues.

The following are some of the questions the game owner was asked, and he not only answered the questions but also gave an elaborate account of the activities that the game reserve has undertaken since its establishment.

1. When and how was the game reserve established?

The game reserve was established in 2002 and at the start had 12 workers. There are now 141 permanent workers. (This study defines permanent workers as those in the service of the gaming enterprise on a full-time basis and who are afforded housing on the farm.) The total area for the game reserve is 10 000 hectares. It started as a game safari catering for visitors who were interested in hunting only on a small scale, but later came to focus

on commercial hunting, catering especially for overseas trophy hunters. It currently attracts 260 visitors per season. When the local hunting market became saturated, the idea of establishing a game reserve was born. The game reserve manager is the principal owner of the reserve, and he and his wife reside permanently on the game reserve. With the boom in tourism and its emphasis on flora and fauna, the reserve owner realised that the photographic safari industry in the Eastern Cape was ready to explode and decided to fulfil a lifelong ambition by turning the farm (agricultural farm) into a Big Five game reserve.

The game owner, who is born and bred South African started with the purchase of an 840 hectare agricultural farm which, with the boom in tourism and its emphasis on eco-tourism, flora and fauna, was turned into a game reserve that is home to the 'big five'. The years following the purchase of this farm were spent acquiring more land and expanding the reserve. This was done by forming partnerships with neighbouring farmers to incorporate their land, or through the purchase of additional farms. When the game reserve opened to the public in 2002, it had grown to 3 500 ha in size. By 2004 it was 6 500 ha and in 2005, it expanded to 10 000 ha. It currently has three lodges and chalets with a total of 44 beds.

Empowerment

Black Economic Empowerment has contributed to the success of the reserve through ensuring an inspired and motivated staff. The owner firmly believes in empowering his employees through creating the opportunity for them to reach their full economic potential, this has been achieved through training of his employees in their respective fields.

As the Mtshelazi game reserve has grown in size and as reserve continues to incorporate neighbouring farms, the owner has made sure that no families have been displaced. The game reserve has absorbed all existing staff on those farms into the Mtshelazi staff complement and even created more jobs. In 1997 there were eight families living on the

first bought farm with just eight people employed in farm work. Mtshelazi currently employs 141 people and the owner is extremely proud of the contribution of the game reserve to sustainable job creation in the Eastern Cape.

The game owner is passionate about empowering women and black women in particular. Mtshelazi employs more women than men (74 women vs. 67 men) and almost twice as many senior and middle management positions are held by women than men (13 women vs. 8 men).

Another area in which Mtshelazi contributes to economic empowerment is by employing both the husband and the wife in a family. Before Mtshelazi became a private game reserve, the land was used for stock and dairy farming. Traditionally, jobs in this type of farming are male-oriented. This meant that mostly it was men were the sole breadwinners in their respective households. At Mtshelazi, there are many jobs for women. This has two benefits: firstly, women are empowered by becoming joint breadwinners and, secondly, and because of this, Mtshelazi would have created double-income families – almost unheard of in this district before.

4.2 Household history and size

Most of the respondents' households (87.5%) are headed by men and only 12.5% by women. Of these respondents, 56% are male wage earners and 44% are women. As shown in the table below, the total household size ranges from 1-10 people per household, so there are an average of three people living with the primary wage earner (thus an average household size of 4). However, one respondent in particular, Household LSO, who earns R1 000 a month, has seven adults and three children, i.e. a total of ten people in his household who are all dependants of the respondent for support.

Table 2- household size

Worker identity	Adults	Children (less than 16 years of age)	Total household size
Household LRP	1	0	1
Household LHA	4	0	4
Household LSO	7	3	10
Household LNO	1	0	1
Household LLE	1	0	1
Household LTD	1	0	1
Household LTDA	2	1	3
Household LLA	2	2	4
Household LNVO	2	0	2
Household LNA	6	3	9
Household LAE	1	0	1
Household LXI	2	1	3
Household LPA	2	0	2
Household LPDA	1	0	1
Household LMO	3	1	4

Sixty-two percent of the respondents were interviewed at their houses within the game reserve and 38% at their place of work. This is because the researcher did not wish to cause unnecessary work disruptions. Of the respondents interviewed, seven were females and nine were males, and of the women interviewed, only two females were household heads. The household size ranged from one to 10 people. Over 50% of the respondents did not live with their children for various reasons, and those who were staying with their children, had children who were not of school-going age or not attending school at all due to the long distances to the nearest primary school.

Table 3 - Residential arrangements of Households interviewed

Worker identity	Live-in family	Live-out family	Total
------------------------	-----------------------	------------------------	--------------

	members	members	members
Household LRP	0	4	4
Household LHA	3	0	3
Household LSO	6	0	6
Household LNO	0	2	2
Household LLE	0	0	0
Household LTD	0	1	1
Household LTDA	2	4	6
Household LLA	3	0	3
Household LNVO	0	2	2
Household LNA	0	8	8
Household LAE	0	3	3
Household LXI	1	5	6
Household LPA	1	4	5
Household LPDA	1	4	5
Household LMO	3	2	5

Findings from this research corroborate those of Connor (2007: 79) from the Sundays River Valley, who found that most of the farm workers' children reside with other family members in other towns or cities. This is because many workers cannot afford the extra expense of private accommodation or lodging in addition to that of school fees for their children studying in town. Nearly nineteen per cent of interviewed farm workers' children of school going age (who in this study are those aged between 5 years and 16 years) do not go to school, because these schools are located far away, and workers do not always have access to transportation. The Mtshelzezi reserve does not provide transportation for farm workers' children and the nearest school is about 10km away,

4.3 Working history

Mtshelzezi game reserve had previously been a commercial agricultural enterprise. As indicated above, four farms were bought out and the total area of Mtshelzezi game farm is

now ten thousand hectares. It emerged that the workers who had worked at the commercial part of the reserve (50% of the employees interviewed) retained their positions; the rest (12.5% from the sample interviewed) retired due to old age but have kept their accommodation. The latter section of the chapter provides more information on the livelihoods of these various categories of employees.

Twenty-five per cent of the workers interviewed is employed on a part-time basis as bush cutters (and these are mostly men) or in the laundry section (these duties are done by women) of the game reserve, whilst a resident, permanent work force (of both men and women) deals with the day-to-day running of the operations at Mtshelazi game reserve. In a province considered to be one of the most impoverished in the country, the game reserve provides much-needed employment. In this context, important questions are whether there have been positive changes in the number of people employed; what working conditions the farm workers experience; and whether there have been measurable improvements in the overall quality of life and livelihood prospects for workers in the move from a commercial farm to private game reserve.

Table 4 Work status before and after farm conversion (from the employees interviewed)

Position	Before	Presently
Permanent workers	50%	100%
Part-time (these are hired on a per needs basis)	37%	25%
Self-employed (these stay at the farm and are involved in other small income generating activities)	12%	0

This study takes as "permanent" workers those workers who are in the service of the game enterprise on a full time basis and are afforded housing on the farm; temporary workers (part-time) do not work for the whole year but also do not work only seasonally and can thus be distinguished from seasonal workers.

From Table 4, it is clear that those who had previously been part-time and seasonal workers when the farm was still under commercial agriculture have been promoted to permanent employment and that some of these have become new employees in the kitchen services. The women interviewed were formerly domestic maids working in the kitchens of their employers' houses and when these farms were bought out or incorporated into the present game reserve, these women were moved to the lodge kitchens. These are the women who were part of the samples that was interviewed and who lives within the private game reserve. When the researcher visited the settlement I only found women but they confirmed that they occupied these houses with their boyfriends. These women have been given these duties because of their previous experience in the farm kitchens and laundry. One of the women interviewed had been working at another private game reserve lodge doing bedding and when she was employed at Mtshlezi game reserve, she was given the same role of seeing to the laundry and bedding in a particular lodge.

Those who have remained on the farm through the shift in the business enterprise (agriculture to game farming) were asked why they have not changed jobs. The respondents (37.5%) said that due to the unavailability for jobs for unqualified people, the jobs that they were doing for example laundry, being game rangers, gardening and being workshop assistants were ideal for them as these job did not require professional qualifications, only experience, and they were the only jobs available that could assure them of a steady income to feed and take care of their families and relatives. The interviewed employees, of which male respondents formed 46%), mentioned that they had previous experience in animal husbandry and tracking and had also worked in a commercial farm's workshop, so that they had developed knowledge of game ranging and mechanics (breakdown and car repairs).

4.4 Education in private game reserves

A lack of proficiency in English and limited skills outside of agriculture have ensured that employees are unable to engage in the broader economic environment of employment. In recent decades, they have indeed been forced out of the farms as a result of retrenchment or eviction and relocation to urban areas has become the lot of many families (Luck, 2004: 52)

Table 5 - Education levels for household wage earners [n=15]

Worker identity	Education level of household head (standard)	Training opportunity (such as waitressing, bar attendants and cooking)
Household LRP	Not sure	Available
Household LHA	Not sure	Not sure
Household LSO	Standard 5	Available
Household LNO	Standard 10	Available
Household LLE	Diploma	Available
Household LTD	Standard 10	None
Household LTDA	Standard 10	None
Household LLA	Standard 8	Never enquired
Household LNVO	Grade 12	None
Household LNA	Not recorded	None
Household LAE	Standard 8	Available
Household LXI	Standard 9	None
Household LPA	Standard 9	None
Household LPDA	Standard 9	None
Household LMO	Not sure (father is head of household)	Too old

The data collected from the sample interviewed showed that employees at Mtshelazi are better educated than is generally found on most farms, as shall be shown in the next chapter. The research found, however, that the workers were not conversant in English,

which could mean that they exaggerated the level of education they had attained or, since most of their learning was done at farm school, English was not the medium of communication (this is my conclusion as during the interviews they could not communicate in English, preferring their mother language: isiXhosa). This led to the conclusion that the education of the workers at Mtshelzezi game reserve is limited to generally being semi-literate. The data collected (from the sample interviewed), suggest that the employees seem to be as educated or better educated than many townspeople in the Eastern Cape.

The limited nature of education among farm workers primarily relates to the inaccessibility of schools in the region. Many workers, especially those with long-standing residence on farms, thus prefer to send their children to public primary schools in nearby towns/cities. Some labourers can afford to pay school fees on a monthly basis, while costs are reduced by children residing with local kin or family whilst attending schools in town (Connor, 2007: 79).

4.5 Medical Aid and Education Plan

Companies are not legally required to provide medical or educational plans to their employees, but it is clearly relevant to the question of corporate citizenship to know what steps Mtshelzezi had taken to help their employees and families members where education and health was concerned. One question that was posed was whether, when the employees fell sick, the company provides transport to a clinic or the nearest hospitals.

The game reserve owner assured the researcher that, he helps his employees with transport to the nearest clinic or hospital and does not make them pay for the service rendered. He also does not evict sick or retired employees from their homes, and on the question of education, he acknowledged the difficulties the children of his staff face, but at the moment he hasn't got the resources (transport for the children to and from the nearest school) to help the children.

Medical aid and educational plans are increasingly regarded as essential to everyday life and for the prosperity of future generations. These two issues were addressed as part of this investigation into the well-being of the employees on Mtshelezi. In their everyday lives the employees are confronted with their own health problems and that of their families. Medicines are becoming more and more expensive, going beyond the reach of ordinary citizens. Farm workers are paid a minimum wage of R1041 per month, which is meant to support an average family of four, send children to school and afford them medical treatment when the need arises.

When the respondents were asked: *Does your employer provide medical aid and educational plan for the children? The following response was recorded:*

“The owner/employer does not pay any medical assistance to any one of the lower level workers” (Household LTA)

When asked to give reasons *why they have no medical aid plan:*

The respondent said, “We were never told and we never asked, so we don’t know, and there is no particular reason provided for not giving us one.”

The same responses were given when they were asked if their employer provided them with educational plans for the children. The respondents expressed the desire to have medical aid and an educational plan but because of their meagre wages they could not afford to join any medical aid schemes. Thus they felt the Government should help them through some form of subsidies or building clinics within the game reserves. The closest clinic that affords workers free medication was in the nearest town, which meant they had to hire a car to ferry the sick which was beyond their means. The Mtshelezi game owner admitted that he did not provide medical aid for the workers, but said that at times he would help with transport to the nearest town if the situation was serious.

4.6 Length of employment

Long-term ownership of agricultural land is reflected by the length of time that workers have lived and worked on a particular farm. Consequently, it is clear that those labourers who have had long-standing employment and residential arrangements with farmers, or forged close relationships on these properties, value the occupation of a home on the game reserve. The average duration of *residence* for workers on the game reserve was 10 years, with the longest being 35 years and the least being 2 years. The workers expressed a desire to remain on the farm, which they related to the benefits attached to their working conditions. These benefits came in the form of housing, as well as amenities such as water and electricity. According to the game reserve owner, the employees from the farms bought or incorporated into the present game reserve were all incorporated into the present establishment. In other words, no worker was evicted from the farms he had bought or incorporated in the game reserve.

Table 6 - Duration of worker *employment* on farm

Worker identity	Previous position	Present position	Years of experience
Household LRP	General hand	Supervisor	6
Household LHA	General hand	General hand	3
Household LSO	General hand	General hand	40
Household LNO	Head chef/Supervisor	Head chef	3
Household LLE	Guide	Lodge supervisor	2
Household LTD	Saleslady	Housekeeper	3
Household LTDA	Housekeeper	Kitchen assistant	5
Household LLA	Cooker	Head chef	16
Household LNVO	Laundry	Laundry	1
Household LNA	General worker	Workshop assistant	3
Household LAE	Entertainer	Dancer	6 months

Household LXI	Student	Dancer	3
Household LPA	Entertainer	Dancer	6 months
Household LPDA	Entertainer	Dancer	3
Household LMO	School	Bartender	2yrs9 months
Household LJE	Milker	Pensioner	30

Of particular importance was the observation made during the interviews that farm workers whose homes were situated close to the main road were more mobile than their more isolated counterparts, who lived up to five kilometres from the main road. The first group of workers have access to nearby towns and cities on a monthly basis to purchase groceries and visit family or children who are schooling in town

4.7 Plans to change jobs

Thirty percent of the respondents had moved into the game reserve from other game farms (in the period 2002 – 2007), and expressed the desire to stay at the game farm and have no intention of moving, saying that they enjoyed better treatment at the game farm. And this, according to the respondents, was a big improvement compared to what they were given by other employers. For example, one respondent used to earn R700 from his former employer also at a game reserve, and was not allowed to stay at the farm, so used to commute from Port Elizabeth at his own expense. However, with the current employer, they are paid R1 650, of which R100 went towards their pension scheme.

Those who have been on the game farm for over five years had a different view to the above respondent. One respondent (from household NVO), expressed the desire to move to a better job, as this present job paid R1000, which was not enough to support the family, as the respondent had children at secondary level in the cities. There was no government support for the children (as they already had financial support from their father though he was not staying with them); the respondent also received support from the boyfriend. The respondent had left her previous job because of low wages, and if this

situation did not change, she planned to leave for a better job. However, there is no guarantee she will get one, as she has no professional qualifications and the only job she knew was doing laundry, which is not a marketable profession.

4.8 Wages and additional income

Part-time workers came occasionally, mostly when the game reserve needed extra help, but they would do the same jobs as the permanent work, for example, repairing roads during the rainy seasons. Women workers were mostly employed to the catering jobs, such as head chefs, kitchen duties, guest house cleaners and laundry duties.

Table 7 - Wages and benefits of primary wage earner

Identity	Gender	Position	Monthly income -	Additional income in new position
Household LRP	M	Supervisor	+R2000	
Household LHA	M	General hand	R1000	
Household LSO	M	General hand	R1000	R4000 (lump sum pension from previous job at commercial farm)
Household LNO	F	Head chef	R1850	
Household LLE	M	Lodge supervisor	R5000	
Household LTD	F	Housekeeper	R1000	R150 (Government child grant per month)
Household LTDA	F	Kitchen assistant	R1000	R150 (Government child grant per month)
Household LLA	F	Head chef	R1800	R1 900 (income from boyfriend also working at the game farm)
Household LNVO	F	Laundry	R1000	R150 (Government child grant per month)
Household LNA	F	Workshop	R1500	

		assistance		
Household LAE	M	Dancer	R1600	
Household LXI	M	Dancer	R1600	
Household LPA	M	Dancer	R1650	
Household LPDA	M	Dancer	R1600	
Household LMO	M	Bartender	R1800	Receives R200 per month from his brothers also working at the game reserve for support as he takes care of their father.
Household LJE	F	pensioner	0	R800 (the pensioner receives R200 per month from her grandchildren working at the game reserve) R150 (she received as lump sum pension from her former employer-commercial farmer)

With regard to wages, the study indicated that highest wages are paid to full-time, resident game reserve workers, both males and females, (who received R1650- R2000 per month at the time of the survey), followed by full-time, less experienced and then casual workers who received R1000 per month. The data also show that those workers who had attained the highest education level (thus Matric or certificate levels) were paid more and were expected to multi-task, i.e. work in different areas of the PGR enterprise, such as being a bartender or being assistant lodge manager . From the figures shown in the table, these wages did fulfil the required minimum wages for farm workers in the Eastern Cape, which is set by the Sectoral Determination as a cash wage of R1041 per month this year 2007 (Dept. of Labour in Grahamstown: 2007).

When looking at wages for men and women at Mtshelazi game reserve, there was no difference in their wages if the job was the same. The difference came in that women did jobs such as working in the kitchen therefore this involved a certain level of expertise and they were paid more when compared to a general worker who was involved in the day-to-

day running of the game reserve. Women who were paid the same wages as general hands were those in the laundry section and upkeep of lodges (cleaners and bed makers, as this job was not considered as requiring less skill than kitchen work). The other issue that I observed was that the younger, educated generation was given opportunities to train in other jobs that even those who had been working on the farm for more than 10 years, but were not educated, could do. The older generation was kept in the fields mostly doing manual labour, but when asked if they would like to be involved in other activities, one respondent felt that he was too old for the type of job done at the game reserve, it was ideal for the younger generation.

1. **Household (LSO):** The informant from this household, who has a standard 5 education, used to earn R500/month. This was when he was employed [as a milker] at the part of this game reserve which was a previously a commercial dairy farm. When the farm was amalgamated into the present game reserve (during 2002), he was incorporated into the new enterprise and he is now paid R1 000/ month. This he feels is still too little and he wishes he could be paid R2 000, which he says “would make a difference”. This indicates perhaps how the cost of living – particularly foodstuffs- has escalated in the past five years.
2. **Household LNO: The informant, a 38-year-old woman,** thinks her present job is better, because as quoted “there is a big difference in wage. [Our] pay is so much better now”. The quality of life has changed for this household as now they “can even save money and have two bank accounts and accounts for furniture. I also have a pay slip”. This change came about because this job came with a promotion to head chef due to her prior experience in the kitchen.
3. **Household LLA,** has lived on this farm for over 16 years, and was present when the farm converted to the game reserve. The respondent, a woman, aged 37 years, has always worked at a lodge (kitchen) as a cook. Before, the respondent was earning a salary of R750 plus overtime, but with the present job, the respondent is earning a salary of R1 800, without overtime. The respondent feels the present

salary is better, even though there is no overtime payment but a similar requirement to work overtime in the new job.

4.9 Accommodation

Most of the respondents had proper accommodation, that is, a brick house, whereas before their complaint was that the houses were not properly constructed. When they lived on the commercial farms, the houses leaked and were cold. But they have other problems in relation to their accommodation, in that they have to share, as one respondent said, “Each house has two families, who share a kitchen and a lounge. The houses have bedrooms which are small for a family of even two.” There were instances where some respondents (four out of seven females interviewed) share a house between three or four people.

The respondent from **Household LRP** says that he occupies a house, but the house belongs to the reserve: “If I decide to retire or to stop working here, the house will no longer be accessible to me.”

When the game reserve owner was asked what happens to the employees after they retire, does he evict them or not from their present houses, he disagreed with what the respondent from household LRP had said, that he does not evict them from these houses, instead he says that he takes care of his employees until they are ‘ready to move on’. Neither does he neglect the sick, because he ensures at times that they receive treatment. This was confirmed by the pensioner I interviewed. She had been working at the same farm when it was a commercial farm (with her husband, who had died) and when it converted to a game reserve she retained their former house and has electricity just like the rest of the work force. Her only complaint was that she feels she was cheated of her pension benefits by the previous employer who only gave her R150 as pension benefits. The reserve owner told of another pensioner who was sick and had been taken to hospital and was still living at the farm. It would have been advantageous if the opportunity of meeting him and verifying this information, but this was not possible,

Another respondent – from **Household LME**, concurred with what the game owner had said. His father is the household head who is still staying at the house that he used to occupy before he retired, when the farmer's agricultural farm was converted to a game reserve. The respondent himself was staying in a shack, close to his family.

Household LHA: While conducting interviews, we came across a household that used to work for one of the small farms that were bought out by the present reserve owner. This respondent previously had contributed to a pension plan organised by his previous employer, but after 37 years of work, when the farm was sold, he received nothing. Instead, he was absorbed into the present work team without a pension and he now has a new pension plan with the present employer. He also claimed to be the only game farm worker with secure rights to residence, this being part of the provision from the previous owner. In contrast, the respondent of Household LNO declared of rights to residential security: "Loss of [a] job means losing [our] house."

4.10 Types of housing

Respondents did not have any major complaints concerning the quality of their housing, with the exception of a few structural problems, such as leaking and broken window panes. In some instances, the issue of different household having to share, which afforded them little privacy, was raised as an issue.

Seventy-five percent of the respondents now have brick houses and the other 25% are staying in one form of more informal accommodation or another, for example, one respondent living off-farm was living in a shack and the other informant in what was could be regarded as a mud (or wattle-and-daub) shack. All these forms of accommodation had electricity. For some, the shift to game farming was for the best as it meant better accommodation, with free electricity installed in their houses (which was not the case before) and water supplied through a communal tank. (When the farm was still a commercial agricultural enterprise, they got their water from a dam that has now

been closed off as it is now used for game animals.) Many of the respondents had brick houses when the farm was still a commercial agriculture farm, but they claimed that these houses were not as well constructed as the ones they have now. The houses they occupy now were constructed by the new game reserve owners, and the game farm owner helped them move from their previous houses.

As the study seeks to establish if there has been a change in the type of accommodation, whether for the better or worse, results from the research show that the farm workers were being accommodated in better housing compared to other reserves within the vicinity. Most of the female respondents stay on-farm and the males and some of the female workers (not interviewed) stay off-farm, because of the nature of the work and the working hours. Those living off-farm reside adjacent to their place of work, i.e. they stay about 300 metres from their workplace. Because of safety concerns, these workers are driven to and from work, and those who stay within the farm, stay in enclosed areas, which also means they have to be transported to and from work.

The respondents staying within the farm had lost their rights to graze livestock. They were never compensated and did not know the channels they could use to inquire about this as labour unions are not allowed at the game reserve. The workers staying off-farm have grazing rights, but the area given to them has no infrastructure such as kraals to keep their livestock.

Water availability was not an issue, since they were provided with clean water from a tank, and the off-farm workers used a communal tank within their compound. The female workers who lived within the perimeter of the game reserve had a tap per two households.

4.11 Energy resource use

All the respondents interviewed during the study acknowledged that their employer provided them with free electricity and water. Though they could use electricity for

cooking, light and heat, some (12.5% of respondents) still used firewood for cooking and heating. Some (6%) used gas only when there was no electricity due to mishaps (in case there was power failure or load shedding); otherwise electricity is their major source of energy. The gas seemed to be the worker's innovation, but I did not inquire how they obtained their gas or if they paid the game owner to purchase the gas for them.

4.12 Source of income

The main source of income for the farm workers was their salaries, which ranged from R1 000-R3 000 depending on the nature of the job. The top of this range is an estimate, as some employees were not comfortable giving details on their exact income level, but indicated that the salary was "above R2500". For example, a general labour earns a basic salary of R1 000, while a dancer earned a salary of R1 650 per month. Other jobs like the post of head chef, which was filled by someone without formal training but with considerable experience, earned R1 850 per month.

One respondent who lived with his father, who is the head of the household, and earned a salary of R1 000 per month as a general hand, received financial support from his father's government pension of R800. There were seven adults and three children in this household. In order for him (the respondent) to make ends meet, he gets remittances from his two brothers also working at the reserve, who each contributed R300 per month. The brothers have their own dependent, but this was a family arrangement in order to help with the upkeep of their father's home, as the respondent is the elder brother. One (female) respondent, whom I shall call Lavec, works as full-time kitchen assistant and earns R1 000. To make ends meet, she receives child support grants from the government in the income range of R151-R300 and is assisted by her pensioner grandmother who earns less than R150 in extra cash by selling vegetables and cigarettes to the compound dwellers.

When asked how much they getting before starting to work at Mtshelazi game reserve (in 2004) kitchen, one respondent replied: "I was getting R750 plus overtime and now I am

getting R1 800 without overtime. The salary is okay but it's just that we don't get overtime.”

At the time when they were given overtime, they were working at the employer's house, not as a lodge kitchen staff. The lodge kitchen staffs do not interact with guests so unlike other jobs such as being a bartender, they do not get tips. However they eat their meals at the lodge, which could be the reason why they are not paid overtime. I did not inquire when they got most overtime hours, whether it was during certain periods of the year or times of the month.

4.13 Other income-generating activities

The respondents in this case were asked if they were involved in any other income-generating activities, if so what were they producing, for whom and what was the ideal season for such activities? The vast majority of the respondents (over 95%) indicated that they were not involved in any sort of additional income-generating activities, as their job was a 16-hour-a-day job, which left very little time to engage in any other money-generating activities to supplement their basic salary. Their working rotation is as follows: they work in cycles of six weeks on and two weeks off, thus for six continuous working weeks they are working full-time [including Saturday and Sunday] and then they are given a two-week break. They look forward to this break and they use these two weeks to visit friends and relatives in the urban centres, thus there is little time to organise and be involved in an income-generating activity.

A small minority of respondent households (5% of the respondents) indicated that they did engage in some additional income-generating activities. These were involved in small garden vegetable production, producing enough to sell among within the compound. The household wage earner in one case also did some shoe repair work for his workmates, earning him less than R150 per year in additional income.

Some of the respondents, particularly the dancers, do however make extra income by doing other duties such as helping in the kitchen when not engaged in their normal duties. These were younger men and women (ranging from 18 years to 22 years) .There were offered duties such as being waiters during the days they are not performing for guests.

4.14 Changes in the conditions of employment

Respondent LNO used to work at a nearby flagship game reserve in the kitchen but was familiar with some aspects of laundry work. When she was retrenched from that game reserve - she was told her services were not needed any more as the section was assumed to employ too many people- and was offered a job at the Mtshelazi, she was hired to work in the laundry section. Asked where she got the knowledge about the job, she indicated that it was “from the previous employers”. This proves that some people are able to increase their skills and make themselves more marketable in the tourism sector.

Forty-three percent of respondents had their day-to-day activities affected a ‘great deal’ by the shift from agriculture to private game reserve, whereas 25% of the respondents felt that there was no change. Predictably, this last group included those workers involved in the general work done at the game reserve., such as game checking, fence mending, and so on A further 12.5% of respondents felt the change in job types affected their day-to-day activities in minor ways. The change in type of job has affected one respondent’s day-to-day activity ‘a great deal’, in the sense that, there is a lot of work to do now, but the money is not enough.

Respondent LNO says: “There are some things I cannot afford anymore, there are no tips.” She was expecting to get tips since this job involves dealing with visitors be they local or international; she claimed that the house she occupies is cold, and her job in the laundry is not as interactive as others. All this led her to saying the working conditions are bad. Comments on “a great deal” by Respondent LRP were: “It’s good (to change job type) for my age. Agricultural farming is difficult for someone my age (58 years). Things were much more difficult during agricultural farming”.

Respondent LTA – “I am doing more than just housekeeping, there are more duties now, for example, I have to prepare salads, bake and cook. Overall, the job is good though my quality of life is still the same.”

When asked why they chose this job, respondents answered as follows: Respondent LAE, a 24-year-old male, said that “the salary is better and I am passionate about the job”. Household LPA: “I choose this job (being a dancer), because I grew up a dancer.” He used to work as a dancer at a nearby game reserve, and then left, as he and his dancing team were not allowed to stay on the farm. Commuting from Port Elizabeth was expensive, and the salary is low. But after changing to Mtshelezi game reserve, his quality of life changed. Here he does other jobs, not only dancing, such as working in the kitchen. Here they are provided with free housing, electricity, dance costumes and the like. The respondent also indicated that they are afforded opportunities for further training: in his case, to be a waiter.

When the respondents were asked if there were other opportunities to improve their marketability, one agreed and said that after being hired, one was trained according to the job hired for. This respondent (Household LME), when asked why he chose this job, responded that it was the only job that was available them. He was trained at work. His quality of life has changed in the sense that he came with no experience but now he is an experienced bartender and this has improved the lives of other household members working at the farm, as they help each other financially. The game reserve has afforded him opportunities for further training such as training in how to run a lodge, in case the lodge managers are not there.

The employment history of those who have been long-term farm residents points to several interesting issues. Three case studies demonstrate some of the changes in their working lives:

1) **Household LHA** previously worked for a cattle and sheep rancher and was responsible for slaughtering on this farm. When it was bought out by the PGR, he became a general hand. He laments the loss of his previous job, as according to him, it had more benefits than the present one. As he says, “some benefits are not available here, for example, we used to get a sheep annually as a bonus”. His day-to-day routine has been affected by this change in type of job, as with the previous job he was a general hand with a specific task and with the present, he is still a general hand, but he has to multi-task. The life of his household members working at the farm has not improved in any way, since he feels that they have the same quality of life as before.

2) **Household LSO**

This household has been living on this farm for over 40 years. Both the respondent and his grandmother who is retired have been here well before the farm was converted into a game reserve. Before this household came to this farm, they used to stay in the area that is now the Addo Elephant National Park. This household has six permanent working adults, two at a nearby game reserve, four working on farms. Their accommodation consists of a three-bedroom brick house, but previously they lived in a mud house.

This respondent receives a monthly salary of R1 000 and from his previous job, he was given a pension lump sum of R4 000 in 2001. To supplement his income he sells meat and beer, which gives him R200 a month, in extra cash. Apart from being a general labourer, this present job opens up other opportunities, in that, at times he works as a builders helping hand at the game reserve. This respondent also notes that there has been a change in his day-to-day activities, as previously he was a milkman with a set work routine and currently he is a tractor driver and has to be on duty whenever tractors are needed. However, though it is a demanding job when compared with the previous one, he still feels the present job is better than the previous one. His quality of life has changed for the better now,

and the lives of his household members working at the PGR have improved as well.

3) Another **household, LLA**, the members of which have lived on this farm for over 16 years is content with the salary these household members are getting. When the farm converted to the present game reserve, the respondent was promoted to a higher position as head chef from being just a kitchen cook and this made the household able “to afford a lot of things which I could not before – my salary is good now”. The lives of household members working at the PGR have improved, as they say they can afford to buy food for their children. When this household was asked if the game reserve afforded them opportunity for further training, the response was “we have never inquired about that, but I would like to improve my cooking skills – to be like the big chefs”.

4.15 Household Livestock ownership patterns

Over 80% of the households interviewed did not own any form of livestock. Households gave varying reasons why they did not keep any livestock. Livestock, especially cattle, goats or chickens, are a form of African pride and a source of income for meeting urgent needs. A lack of this source of income often means heightened income vulnerability. As one household responded, “we are not allowed to own livestock because they would be eaten by lions”. This was volunteered by one of the female respondents who reside within the game reserve. Respondents were asked whether households with members employed at the PGR owned livestock or not, and if not allowed to keep livestock, was there any compensation of some sort. The households residing off-farm were quick to point out that, yes, they were allowed to keep – but there were not enough infrastructure to support such a venture. Some people kept chickens, but there was no compensation for being unable to keep livestock. The researcher also observed that those who lived within the game reserve, who comprised 26% of the sample and all female respondents, had security fencing around their compounds, which meant that they could not keep cattle, sheep or goats, but only chickens. Sixty per cent of the respondents could keep livestock (cattle)

but the number was too few for their liking, because the land reserved for livestock is just open fields, with no structures like kraals to keep their animals. This situation would pose great danger to their livestock stock-thieves and predators.

Some of the households could not keep livestock due to the nature of their jobs. The hours that they work are different from commercial ones, in that whilst in commercial farms people work for eight hours, in private game reserves they work between 10 and 16 hours a day. It is these households that fall within the 80% of interviewed household that had no form of livestock. Among the households that kept livestock, one household (Household LNA) had 12 chickens and 6 pigs, but previously did not own any livestock.

Household LPA (a woman dancer aged 24), said, “The PGR owner does allow us to have livestock only I don’t want any for now.” Household LHA, which had been living on the farm for over 40 years and was part of the household when the game reserve was converted from an agricultural dairy farm to a game reserve, previously owned five cattle and one chicken but now has none. His reason was that he had sold them as the area they were given had no kraals or pens and he could not afford to pay a herder.

Under the previous agricultural farming regime, the farm workers were allowed to keep stock, though the land provided was not demarcated into separate areas for farming and keeping livestock. While labourers were free to do what they like with their own livestock (if they kept any), they had limitations on the amount of livestock (cattle) that they could have. In terms of the possibility of claiming compensation for the loss of their rights to own cattle, some households indicated that they were unsure if there was any such thing as claiming compensation. Household LSO agreed that they are allowed to keep livestock but felt that “the area [available to them] is still too small for livestock production”. All workers have the opportunity to plant a small vegetable garden of their own, though some chose not to do so.

4.16 Dispute resolution

Disputes (such as working conditions, wages, etc) at this game farm are resolved through the intervention of the foreman and not a trade union representative. One respondent said “it was because trade unions require subscriptions and our salaries are not enough for that” (Household LRP). Another respondent – Household LXI – said “Everything is handled by the management and the leader or chairman of the committee”. The workers have an executive committee, and the foreman who handles cases of dispute that require mediation. In most cases the dispute is resolved directly by the reserve owner/manager. In fact, it emerged that disputes here are resolved by management or by their supervisors, and the workers are not allowed to be members of a labour union. Respondents indicated that sometimes disputes were not resolved within a reasonable period of time.

Regarding disputes, respondent LLA had this to say, “We discuss [the problem] with the foreman, who in turn seeks resolution from the farm boss.” Another respondent, a pensioner whose grandsons work at the game reserve, had this to say about how disputes were solved during their time (under the previous agricultural regime) “directly, solved with the employer”.

4.17 Training opportunities for advancement

The respondents volunteered that, under the PGR, they were afforded greater opportunities for training. The reserve owner would arrange with trainers from Rhodes University to have training provided for them, especially in areas that had to do with dealing with visitors, for instance in people management courses. Another respondent agreed with what his colleague had said, i.e. that there were other opportunities for advancement. He said, “After hiring you, you are trained according to the job you are hired for.” For example, one would be trained to run a lodge in case the line managers are not there. It does appear, however, that such job training was only provided to those who were better educated, such as those who had a Grade 12 education. So while most of the respondents (over 50%) interviewed expressed no knowledge of this training programme

having been conducted at the reserve, twenty-five percent of the respondents have in fact gone through the training. However, the problem they faced was that there was no time to do other courses, as the nature of the job needed one to work a 16-hour shift for a period of six weeks.

When the game reserve owner was asked about *the training for future development*, he indicated that it involved mostly “those in the catering services such as the kitchens doing food preparation and presentation.” When Mtshlezi first opened, the reserve hired qualified chefs for their kitchens. Industry-wide, staff turnover amongst chefs is said to be notoriously high and the decision was taken to rather train up their existing kitchen staff to be able to produce the safari cuisine Mtshlezi is “famous” for. They have taken women who were originally peeling vegetables and washing dishes and trained them. Now they have reached the point where they are running their own kitchens and producing dishes of “world-class standard”. To this end, they hired the best catering industry trainer in Port Elizabeth as their Catering Manager and Executive Chef. She has ensured that the cooks have acquired the necessary skills to produce meals with confidence and to interact with our guests over the buffet. The owner of Mtshlezi said he was “thrilled” to see their pride when guests send their “compliments to the chef”.

4.18 The specific nature of work activities

When the researcher asked the respondents the following question on changes in job activities:

Has the change in type of job had any effect on your day-to-day activities?

The responses to this question were varied. One respondent felt that the change in job type had greatly affected their day to day activities “from being a general hand when the farm was [under] commercial agriculture, to being a mechanic - something that I have always wanted and am good at. Yes, now we are always busy repairing our vehicle and others”. And when asked if it was demanding, his response was, “In such a workplace everything happens every day, so there’s always some mechanics to do.”

In some cases, the new job affected the day-to-day activities of the respondents to a lesser extent. In such cases, respondents noted that they were doing more than just house-keeping. One respondent felt that the present job was better than the previous one as she was working as part of a team, compared to the previous when she worked alone in the kitchen.

4.19 Conclusions:

It is important to note that the previous circumstances of the households which now have members working on the PGR are not uniform. Some of the households have stayed on these farms for several decades. As pointed out, one respondent and his family have been staying on this farm for over 40 years. He was in fact born on the farm when it was still a dairy farm. Though his father is now retired, the respondent and his brothers were fortunate to have been hired by the father's former employer. Others have come from a range of other types of employment and residential histories. The question of whether the shift to game farming has seen a general improvement in the conditions of employment or quality of lives of all these people is thus more difficult to answer conclusively than initially thought. Still, it is possible to isolate several key differences that can be attributed to the shift in enterprises. The most important of these are:

- (i) It appears that younger, better educated people are likely to secure better-paying employment on the PGR.
- (ii) The nature and conditions of the sale of the farm to the PGR can impact on the employment secured by workers in the new dispensation. If the previous farmer gave a worker a good testimonial, he or she may have secured a decent job at the PGR and in isolated cases may even have rights to residence in the absence of a job at the PGR, although these rights are likely to be tenuous.
- (iii) In general, it is clear that the conditions of employment and residence in terms of the provision of services such as housing, electricity and water to employees have improved, but it is not clear from the data whether this is attributable to the general improvements in these areas that are required of

farmers in terms of the relevant labour legislation or if it is a direct result of the shift from an agricultural production farming system to an enterprise in the game and tourism/hospitality sector.

- (iv) It is however, difficult to generalise about any of these issues, beyond this one example, because what emerges is that much of the decision-making that affects the daily lives and livelihoods of employees continue to be made by the reserve owner/manager. One case in point is that of labour union membership which is not allowed on this PGR.
- (v) Workers are tied to these jobs, because of the very long working hours that prevent them from doing anything else to earn money.
- (vi) Some of them have opportunities to learn new skills: but which people are these and which ones don't have these opportunities? How will growing differentials in earnings reproduce the poorly educated workers in the next generation? The findings presented here have begun to explore these complex issues, but it is clear that further in-depth and longitudinal research is needed to really get to grips with these issues.

Chapter 5- Data analysis and discussion

5.0 Introduction

When addressing issues of corporate citizenship there is a need to first look at what contributes to a business being labeled a model corporate citizen, which involves considering issues of corporate responsibility. Corporate social responsibility is defined in previous chapters as the commitment of a business to the social upliftment of its workers and the community around it. It is in this respect that the South African Government institutionalized corporate governance through the publication of the King Report on Corporate Governance first in 1994 (King Report in 1994) and the second edition in 2004 (King Report II). This report formalized the need for companies to recognise that they no longer act independently from the society in which they operate.

It is the purpose of this chapter to explore the extent to which the Mtshelazi game reserve shows commitment to the well-being of its employees and their families and how in the process, they have shown their commitment to the tenets of Corporate Citizenship. Because of the limitations of time and other resources, the research on which this dissertation is based was unable to address all the principles of corporate citizenship as prescribed in the corporate social responsibility framework, Instead, specific aspects of corporate citizenship have been considered and others have had to be left unanswered here, in the hope that future research will pick up these equally important issues.

As Chapter Four has indicated, the following are some of the aspects that have been investigated in this study:

- Employment levels
- Housing (type of accommodation)
- Education (level of education)
- Social upliftment (change in quality of life)
- Access to secure title deeds

Training opportunities (future advancement)

The approach taken in this chapter is to compare the conditions of Mtshelzezi game reserve workers (16 workers out of 141 from the study area) and those of commercial farm workers in the vicinity of Mtshelzezi. This is done by close consultation and careful extrapolation from recent studies done by Haworth (2006), Luck (2003), and Connor (2007), as well as the research and advocacy work of ECARP, done on game reserves and commercial farms in the Eastern Cape in order to come to some conclusions about the extent to which the game reserve is a corporate citizen.

In the time available to conduct the study, the researcher was unable to establish the whereabouts of the previous agricultural farms, in order to ascertain the exact numbers of workers they had before they sold their farms to the game reserve. Instead, the information provided by the present game reserve owner during an interview was what had to be relied upon in this regard. To obtain a better insight into the lives of game reserve workers, an investigation into the lives of these workers before the establishment of the game reserve was attempted.

This chapter looks at issues as mentioned earlier, such as employment, accommodation, education, medical care, wages and access to secure property before and after the conversion to game farming in reaching a (tentative) conclusion about the 'corporate citizenship' status of the Mtshelzezi game reserve.

5.1 Income and Employment

Prior to the conversion of the game reserve in 2002 from an 860 hectare agriculture farm, the farm had 8 families living and working on it. After 2002, through buying adjacent farms or forming partnerships with them, the total area of the game reserve is 10 000ha, with a total workforce of 141. The present game reserve consists of the original small farm and four other farms, and although records of the worker numbers from the bought /incorporated properties was not available to this researcher, documented information

from the game reserve owners indicate that all workers from these other farms were incorporated into the present game reserve.

As shown in the previous chapter, the monthly wage of the workers when it was an agricultural farm was approximately R700. When the farm converted to a game reserve, the monthly wage for the workers ranged between R1 000 and R2 000 for those doing general work, while those doing specialised jobs, like being chefs, are getting a monthly wage of R1 650 (as shown in the table in chapter 4).

Table 8 - Recommended wage increases for employees

Minimum wages for employers with 10 or less workers			Minimum wages for employers with more than 10 workers		
Minimum rate for the period 1 July 2007 to 30 June 2008			Minimum rate for the period 1 July 2007 to 30 June 2008		
Monthly	Weekly	Hourly	Monthly	Weekly	Hourly
R1 480.00	R341.60	R7.59	R1 650.00	R380.80	R8.46
Minimum wage increases for the two years hereafter will based on CPIX plus two percentage points annually.					

Source: Daily Dispatch 2007/07-Thursdsay

Some of the workers who used to work on the farm that is now part of the reserve have retired but still live on the game farm. The game owner maintains that staff members who are not currently employed by the PGR are retired, and “moved on”, or are still staying at game reserve with family members who have been employed by the game reserve. This research concurs with what the game owner said. One of the findings of this research was that family members (sons, daughters, grandson/daughters) of the retired workers have been absorbed by the game reserve, and some were given their accommodation on or off the game reserve, meaning that after the conversion to game reserve, no labourers were laid off from this particular PGR. This is not necessarily true of the other 12 game reserves in Eastern Cape.

Of the 141 permanent operational and managerial staff that the game reserve currently employs, 74 are woman and 67 are men, suggesting that the game reserve recognised the issue of gender equity. In the study done by Langholz and Kerley (2006: 10), there has been an overall factor increase in employment of 4.5 and another study done by Howarth (2006: 10) showed a significant increase since the establishment of the PGR (in his study), with employment increasing by a factor of 4.5 overall and by 3.0 for the operational staff. The figure of 4.5 includes managerial staff, which is not relevant for the study as it will distort the factor increase upwards, so a more realistic figure of 3.0 that is given is ideal as it takes into account only operational staff when estimating the benefits of the establishment of the PGR on the surrounding areas (Howarth, 2006: 10). While Howarth (2006) did an in-depth study involving managerial staff employment, this study of Mtshelzezi addresses only the conditions pertaining to operational staff, namely the unskilled and semi-skilled (African) workers.

Over 90% of the respondents were recruited from the immediate area (communities immediately bordering on the PGR, such as agricultural farms, other game reserves and some from Grahamstown) and out of these over 90% were absorbed from the farms incorporated/bought to establish the game reserve. According to the information supplied by the game reserve owner- “As the game reserve has grown in size and as we have incorporated neighbouring farms, we have made sure that no families have been displaced. We have absorbed all existing staff on those farms into the Mtshelzezi staff and even created more jobs. Given that in 1997 there were eight families living on first bought farm, with just eight people employed in farm work and that Mtshelzezi currently employs 141 people, I am extremely proud of the contribution of Mtshelzezi to sustainable job creation in the Eastern Cape”.

As mentioned earlier in the chapter, these workers are mostly relatives and offspring of the former agricultural farm workers who retired and continued to stay on the property. Less than ten per cent were recruited from elsewhere in the Makana municipal area, which is indicative of the employment effect that the establishment of the PGR has been on the communities in and around the PGR.

By comparison, Howarth's (2006: 11) study revealed that 5% of the managerial staff originates in the Makana Municipal District, which is an indicative of the limited need to import skilled labour from outside areas. At Mtshelzi, a total of 80% of the respondents have had previous work experience as farm labourers or supervisor due to their long stay with the same farm, but are still treated as general workers, which is proof of their status as unskilled labour.

The previous work experience and status of the respondents indicate that the PGR has had a positive impact, from an employment perspective on the immediate area surrounding the PGR and in the Makana municipal area. The PGR has employed the children of its retired workers and other people who were evicted from or left their previous employment because of low wages from other surrounding farms.

Another factor of importance is that of the number of dependants supported by the employees of the game reserve. Working on an average of 3-4 dependants per employee, the 141 employees support a total of 564 dependants (median of 4 dependants per employee). A study by Langholz and Kerley (2003:13), of ten PGRs in the Cacadu District Municipality, a more optimistic of employment creation is arrived at: this study works with a median of seven or eight employees per reserve, a median of 353 dependants, with a median of 4.5 dependants per primary wage earner was used. Another study on one PGR by Howarth (2006: 11) came out with an average of 2.88 per employee, (operational staff-unskilled). Some of these primary wage earners have been employed by the game reserve as mentioned earlier on.

The percentage of employees who are primary wage earners and head of households was 95% of the respondents interviewed in the Mtshelzi study, with less than 5% of these respondents being primary wage earners but not household heads. In the study by Langholz and Kerley (2006; 13) a median of 80% of workers were found to be primary wage earners. Another study that included managerial staff found that 67% of the staff in

the study are primary wage earners, with 91% of operational staff stating that they have family members who depended on them for income (Howarth, 2006: 11).

Before the inception of the Mtshelzezi game reserve in 2002, the farm workers were getting a wage of between R500 and R750, depending on their type of job. A milker for example was paid a cash wage of R750. Since the inception of the game reserve, the wages have increased substantially: the general game workers are paid a wage of R1 000 (R1 040 is the minimum wage according to the Labour Department 2007), and those with specialised jobs like kitchen chefs get R1 850, a gardener R1 900, a dancer R1 650 and a mechanic R1 950. The game reserve owner identified skills within his workforce and promoted some of them from being, for example, a gatekeeper to a lodge manager, due to their people skills, or from a general day-to-day worker to a mechanic if he or she showed such talent. So this had to increase in their wages by a factor of 3.7 and the rest of the operational staff by a factor of 2. Managerial staffs are paid an entry level wage of R5 000 (imported skilled workers from other areas or game reserve). The total overall wage bill for the game reserve for unskilled and semi-skilled workers (excluding the skilled, management staff and the reserve owner's salaries presently is R365 000 for the game reserve, while previously it was R9 600. In a study on a PGR within the same vicinity as Mtshelzezi, Howarth found that the overall average monthly wage per employee is R2 577, comprised of R1 406 for operational staff and R4 973 for managerial staff, which concurs with the finding of this study as well (Howarth, 2006:12).

Howarth (2006:12) recognises that conservation and tourism can and should be a powerful tool for wealth creation and poverty alleviation. When considering these employment and income effects, there is no doubt that the PGR is meeting the criteria of good corporate citizenship. This is evidenced by the extent to which the Mtshelzezi game reserve identifies talents within its own labour force and enhances these talents and puts them into good use. This also shows that the game reserve has had a positive impact on the area since its establishment. When considering the operational staff, employment on

the land itself has increased by a factor of 3.0, while the average income has increased by a factor of 2.0.

Research by Howarth (2006:13) on the 12 farms around the PGRs in the Makana Municipality revealed the 50% of PGR employees were living on these farms. This was clearly illustrated in the present study of the Mtshelazi PGR, as some of the respondents lived on the reserve while others lived off the reserve, or on part of the PGR that falls outside the game fences. This indicates that there is a need to look at the total work force, in order to ascertain whether or not all the employees do stay on the farm. The respondents noted that the reasons for their families not staying with them, was that, schools around the game reserve were too far; they could not afford transport costs to these schools; and most only go up to Grade 7, so for further education the children needed to go to towns and cities close to the game reserve.

5.2 Housing, Water and Tenure Security

5.2.1 Housing

This research found that workers at this game reserve had adequate accommodation and better living conditions as compared to their colleagues in other game reserve. Interviews with some of the employees were done at their houses, which, from observation are brick houses. Thus the researcher could not describe living conditions for all the workers at the game reserve, as some interviews were done at their place of work, but the findings are based on the sample the researcher used. Work done by Howarth (2006) showed that some of the workers on that game reserve lived on neighboring commercial farms.

5.2.2 Water

The respondents living on the game reserve receive water from taps within the yard, and they share a tap among two houses, with each house is occupied by two households. Those staying outside game reserve receive their water from a community tank, with all households within the compound sharing this source of water. The farm workers had

access to water even before the farm was converted to a game farm. In other cases recorded by ECARP, the farm workers on some farms are not provided with water and as a result have to steal water from neighboring farms. By stealing water, the farm workers risk being charged with trespassing. In one of these cases, farm workers had access to water before the farm was sold and turned into a game reserve, after which they were cut from the main source of water and now they get their water from neighboring farms or dams (ECARP, 2005).

5.2.3 Tenure Security

The workers at the game reserve do not have tenure security for the houses they occupy. This was a cause for concern to most respondents, who feared that after retirement, they would be removed from the game reserve. Some of these workers have been living on these farms all their lives, i.e. well before the land was converted to PGR use. Among the sample that the researcher interviewed, there were two former commercial workers on a farm that was bought out and became part of the game reserve. These respondents are retired and they still occupy the same houses they have had since, so this fear was laid to rest, as these respondents were told to stay as long as they wanted. The researcher came to the conclusion that the workers were most probably not informed that they would not be removed from this accommodation, hence the respondents' 100% response that they would be evicted after retirement.

The game owner concurred with what the pensioners had said: after retirement none of his workers would be removed from their houses. Workers staying within the farm and those off the farm, have free electricity and stay in brick houses, pay no rent for these houses, and get free water as mentioned earlier. This indicated that the game reserve was doing all it could to ensure its workers were better taken care of than before. One notable issue the researcher found was that workers have no labour representation at the farm, so all their disputes are dealt with by farm management, (supervisor or committee chairman) or at times by the owner himself, but 99, 9% of the time; their issues are heard and addressed by the supervisor.

The East Cape Agricultural Research Project (ECARP, 2005) has done extensive research on farm workers and dwellers around the municipalities of Makana (my study area), Ndlambe and Sunday's River in the Eastern Cape Province (commercial farms). They found that the vast majority of farm dwellers still live under very poor conditions: they lack proper housing, with no clean water, no sanitation, no tenure security and lack alternative means of livelihoods, which is coupled with very poor wage rates.

5.3 Keeping of Livestock

Farm workers find it difficult to own livestock, since property owners prohibit the transfer of livestock from one property to the other when employing a new worker. In this sense, keeping livestock appears to be regarded by the land-owner as a privilege to be earned by a worker rather than an inalienable right. In some cases, farm workers are allowed to keep livestock but due to the nature of the job (in game reserves) they do not have the time to take care of their animals, or the land is not demarcated into holding pens, so it becomes difficult to manage their animals (Connor, 2007: 91). This was true for the game reserve being studied as shall be noted in the ensuing paragraphs.

As pointed out in Chapter Four, employees at Mtshelazi who lived on the adjacent land belonging to the game reserve are allowed to keep livestock, but they could not do so due to the lack of proper infrastructure to keep the livestock such as cattle, sheep, or goats. The nature of the job also inhibits such developments as these workers are on duty from seven o'clock in the morning till five in the evening, so there is no time to spend on such activities, even though they want to. Land is provided for keeping, but as mentioned above, the animals (livestock) need to be herded or else they venture into neighboring farms or get stolen. Unlike their counterparts in commercial farms, these employees are not charged a fee for keeping any form of livestock. In commercial farms, keeping of livestock is allowed, though one or two of these commercial farms charge amounts ranging from R10 per cow to R30 per cow depending on the farm owner, and at some of these commercial farms, the number of livestock one can keep is limited to anything between one and 10 cows. When the farm is sold or converted to a game reserve, grazing

rights are often taken away and farm workers and dwellers are forced to sell their livestock (ECARP, 2005). This situation is similar to game farm workers living within the farm. Because of the presence of large predators, these have high fence around their compound, so space is limited, thereby making it difficult to keep any form of livestock other than chickens.

5.4 Availability of land for gardening

At the game reserve, the employees are allowed to have gardens where they can grow their own vegetables and crops. In some cases, the farm workers do not plant gardens, as there is not enough time to do this, due to the nature of their job. The systems of work found at most game reserves are as follows:

- For six weeks they are working long hours, as all of them are on a full-time basis.
- For two weeks, they have a rest period and most of the workers use this to rest or visit friends and relatives in nearby towns.

There is enough water and land at the game reserve for gardening and cropping activities. The farm workers do plant their gardens, but on a small scale, enough to feed the family and sell some to families within the compound. ECARP (2005) found that in some cases, as farms changed hands, new owners stopped people from gardening. The game reserve establishment has had a positive impact on the livelihood of the communities around them, as it allows its workers to plant gardens, and keep livestock on designated lands that will not be affected by wildlife.

5.5 Accessibility to schools

As noted in the previous chapter, the main problem when it comes to provision of education seems to be the number of children of school-going age on the reserve. Farms would have a population of twenty or less – this includes adults, and as a result, a number of schools have been closed down due to small number of children. Even where children have access to school, they would have to travel long distances with no transport (Manganeng, 2005). This researcher has also found out that children of the farm workers

attend school in Grahamstown as all schools around the Mtshelazi game reserve are far, over five kilometers away. Also, as found by Manganeng (2005), some of these schools do not go up to Grade Twelve level. For instance, in one of the farms, the school only goes up to Grade Eight, so the farm workers have to rely on their relatives in townships for their children to stay and attend school or rent rooms for them. This becomes costly, and on top of this, children have to grow up in townships with little or no parental supervision. This issue has not been addressed by the game reserve in this study.

5.6 Land ownership

According to the respondents at the game reserve, farm workers do not own any land, nor do they own the houses they are occupying. Farm workers would like to own land, and cite three main reasons: security of tenure, livelihood and for them to have proper housing (Manganeng, 2005). According to Manganeng (2005), farm dwellers are fully aware of the effect of the growth of the game farming in this region is having on not only their livelihoods, but also on the prospects of their ever being landowners in the future.

5.7 Discussion

5.7.1 Wages

Wages are the most important aspect of most of the working people's employment relationship. Naidoo et.al (2007:39) found that wages for the game reserve workers have been increased in compliance with the minimum wage requirements as stipulated by the Department Labour, which is R1 041 per month for general workers, such as drivers, field workers (bush cleaning and fencing etc), game guarding, and tracking, on game farms. In game farming, there was a reduction in the number of workers who earned between R801 and R1000 per month as their wages increased to R1041 after the introduction of the minimum wage (Naidoo, Klerck and Manganeng, 2007: 39). In other farms, the majority of male farm workers earn more than their female counterparts for the

same work (Luck, 2003: 32), but at Mtshelzezi game reserve wage levels are determined by the type of job being done, not by the gender of the employee.

Previously, before the game reserve was established, the farm workers were paid cash wages, which were extremely low, with the bulk of the wage being constituted through rations and housing, grazing and any medical benefits. Low wages meant dependency on the farmer and as a result of such conditions; farm residents led a very circumscribed life. Their bargaining power was virtually non-existent and people remain largely dependent on the goodwill of farmers (Luck, 2003: 50). The workers at the game reserve now have bank accounts and can afford to have furniture accounts. To the workers at the game reserve, this ability to buy furniture on credit is taken as an indication of their changing social status, giving them more pride and contributing to a more positive self-image. As they see it, they are not dependent on the farmer any longer, but the game reserve is dependent on their loyalty. This is another area where the game reserve has had a positive impact on the lives of its workers.

5.7.2 Living conditions and livelihood of commercial farm workers

In order to better understand the role that the game reserve has played in positively changing the living conditions of its workers, the next section looks at the living conditions and livelihood of commercial farm workers in area in which Mtshelzezi PGR is located, and will also shed some light on the respondents' previous histories, especially addressing issues raised by the 'game workers' who were present on the farms when the farms were converted to this present game reserve.

5.7.3 Housing on farm

There are four types of housing that can be found on the farm, brick /cement buildings, mud house, shacks /wattle and zinc/corrugated iron houses. According to ECARP(2005), there are also combinations whereby dwellers in a particular farm will have different

types of housing, or a particular house will be a combination of any of the four (e.g. a cement house being extended using mud and wattle or corrugated iron sheets).

The game reserve provides brick/cement housing for its workers, though from the response I got, employees complained about some of the houses being in bad condition with leaking roofs, and not having been properly built. There is no evidence of gender differences in terms of housing provisions as households were headed by men and women. The game reserve owner is actually biased towards women as he feels women have been oppressed for too long a time. If one looks at the staffing records, it is clear that there are more women (74) than men (67) employed at Mtshelazi.

Game reserve workers staying within the reserve live in proper brick houses with flush toilets. Pensioners also live in brick houses that they have been using from the time the farm was still commercial. Some of the younger workers at the game reserve share a house among four people. These were mostly found on the part of the land that belongs to the game reserve, but which lies outside the game fences of Mtshelazi PGR. Some of the workers live in smaller cement houses, and occasionally during the interviewing process I came upon one worker who was staying in a zinc /corrugated iron shack. The workers at the game reserve do not pay rent for the houses, nor do they pay for electricity or the water they consume. By contrast, studies by ECARP (2005) have revealed that payment for housing ranges from R15 to R270 per month, and in most cases, these payments are in contravention of the Sectoral Determination provisions as water and electricity are not available. I did not inquire whether or not the workers now employed at Mtshelazi had previously (when farm was under commercial agriculture), paid rent for housing and for their electricity and water consumption.

5.7.4 Education

Farm workers at the game reserve are poorly educated. Some respondents could not remember what grade they did, while some could give only an estimate of their level of education. The farm workers also lacked proficiency in English, something that reduces their chances for upward mobility in the tourism/hospitality sector. Research done by

Luck (2003: 52) support these findings, namely that levels of education among the game workers are low to average in most cases. Low levels of education were especially prevalent among the older generation of workers who had worked at the farm long before it converted to a game reserve. The reason given for this low level of education was that schools were too far and offered lower grades only. It is well-known of course, that in the past and in terms of the unskilled requirements of farm labour, and it did not make sense for the farmers to expend time and effort on the education needs of their work-force or the offspring of their workers.

Most of these workers have knowledge of agriculture but not of this type of hospitality industry work, which clearly needs a certain amount of education, especially proficiency in English, as the job entails dealing with local and foreign visitors. According to Luck (2003:52), 37% of interviewed farm workers have a Standard 2 (minimum literacy threshold), 25% have Standard 3-5; only 13% have any secondary education. The Mtshelazi survey revealed that 25% had no knowledge of their grades, 43.75% have Standard 5-10 and 6.25% have a diploma /certificate. These findings were from the respondents interviewed. Clearly, to understand fully the current situation in respect of education levels and opportunities requires a more comprehensive study dedicated to this issue.

5.7.5 Training opportunities for future advancement

In addressing the issue of employees, the game reserve has concentrated on the importance of employee development and advancement for the good of the individual as well as the success of the business. With reference to the above, the game reserve owner is passionate about empowering his employees, especially women according to this statement, “I am fanatical about empowering women and black women in particular. Mtshelazi employs more women than men and almost twice as many senior and middle management positions are held by women than men (13 women vs. 8 men). The Deputy CEO, the General Manager, the Catering Manager and Executive Chef, the Front Office Manager, the Head Ranger, the Shop Manager, the Marketing Manager and the Conferencing Manager are all women. One of our black receptionists has recently been promoted to Assistant

Lodge Manager at one of the Lodges. As soon as she has passes her driver's license, she will achieve the role of actual Lodge Manager.”

The game reserve identifies talents from the 44% of employees who have Standards 5-10, trains them, with a view to promoting them. By retaining its workers, it ensures that they will always be loyal to the game reserve for giving them the opportunity and so will most likely not leave the PGR. This also shows that the game reserve believes in enriching its community through such training programmers. It is also true that not all the employees of the game reserve had at the time of the study been given the opportunity for such training, but what came across from the respondents, was that those who showed commitment to their jobs and were of the younger generation of ages between 20-40, had indeed been given the opportunity to train in other fields; for example, a dancer would be given the chance to work in the kitchens or at the bar, attending to guests.

This, the respondents felt, was beneficial as it opened opportunities for changes in the long run. This was not found at other game reserves that they have worked before. For instance, it was pointed out by the workers that a caterer is hired from Port Elizabeth, who trains the staff on meal preparation and presentation.

5.8 Conclusions

A range of six indices that deal with social responsibility in relation to corporate citizenship were presented and analysed here, in the context of the findings of other recent studies undertaken in the immediate vicinity of the study site.

Farm workers at Mtshelazi game reserve are afforded free electricity and housing without having to pay for the above, something that is still unheard of in the commercial farming sector in the Eastern Cape. The most important factor to note is that despite the game workers being unskilled and with minimum education, the game reserve identifies talents within its employees and trains them, so that they become better equipped, more self-sufficient individuals. This also creates a certain level of confidence and assurance to the

game workers that they will not be dismissed and this makes the workers loyal to their employers.

It is clear, that notwithstanding the profit-seeking business model adopted at Mtshelazi, the reserve owner is deeply committed to the social upliftment of his employees and the community in which Mtshelazi is situated. For example, he recognises the importance of Mtshelazi in creating jobs for local people and so most their employees originate from the Nelson Mandela Bay or Makana districts. Many of the employees, who were not originally living on the land comprising Mtshelazi, in fact come from neighbouring farming areas and from Alicedale, all of which are economically depressed. With no assistance from government, the game reserve has provided free housing with free water and electricity to 95% of our staff – those who choose to live on the game reserve. This is a cost that urban businesses do not have to bear. Most other game reserves in the Eastern Cape leave it up to their employees to find their own accommodation in nearby towns and then bus them in to work each day.

Another factor to note is that despite the game workers not having tenure rights to the houses or land they are staying, the game reserve does not evict the retired or those who are sick. This was evidenced by the case of two pensioners that I came across. They continue to occupy the houses they have been living in from the time when the game reserve was still a commercial farm. The game reserve has employed pensioners' children and grandchildren and some evicted employees from the surrounding commercial farms and game reserves.

Turning to the wages paid to the game reserve workers, the game reserve pays its people according to the minimum wage recommendation by the Department of Labour (which is R1041 per month), and some of the semi-skilled (they do not have qualification but experience of the job) like the chefs and waiters, are paid more than what is recommended by the Hospitality industry board. These have their own wage levels, the recommended being R1650, while the game reserve pays such staffs R1800-R1900 per month.

The game reserve has set aside land for gardening and livestock keeping. The only limiting factor to the employees wishing to keep livestock is that there is no infrastructure such as holding pens and due to the nature of their job there is little time for the workers to venture into livestock keeping or to do market gardening. The only gardens they can plant are those that can be used to suppose the family but very little for sale, thereby creating a situation where employees, are not involved in any extra incoming generating activities. The PGR has not placed a restriction on the number livestock the employees can keep.

The establishment of the game reserve has resulted in fundamental changes to farm occupier's tenure condition. In many instances no consideration is given to the tenure rights of farm occupiers, nor to the future sources of their livelihood, but at Mtshelezi PGR, despite the farm workers having no tenure rights to the land or houses, the PGR does not evict its retired workers or sick former employees. These have been allowed to stay on the farm and occupy the same houses that there have been using well before the convention from commercial agriculture to game farming, in addition to this, their dwellings have been electrified for free. The PGR owner and management are respectful of the fact that people have lived on farm, which has been converted to game farms for most of their lives.

The quality of life has improved for the game workers at this PGR, as according to the respondents interviewed, they can now afford to open furniture accounts, have two bank accounts and provide for their families which they could not do when the farm was still under commercial agriculture. The other aspect of quality of life was the change in social status of the farm employees. The PGR, as mentioned in the previous chapter, identified talents among its employees, trained them for other jobs other than just being either a gate man or just a general workers. General workers have been trained as waitress, especially the young generation and promoted likewise, thus ensuring an improved source of income.

This change in social status of employees is seen as a positive move towards the betterment of the employees by the PGR. The results of this study reveal that the game reserve has made strides in the implementation of corporate social responsibility principles that address the issue of community well-being. The benefits identified by the researcher include job creation, improved skills of employees through in house training and the opportunity for promotion within the private game reserve, which enabled an increase in the employment opportunities and earning potential of game workers who were previously commercial farm workers.

What emerges is that Mtshelazi PGR has made considerable progress in meeting its immediate social responsibility obligations *to its own labour force*. Starting from a particularly low base in respect of the benefits that were enjoyed by its employees under the previous agricultural regime, the benefits appear impressive and have resulted in a noted improvement in the quality of life of the employees at Mtshelazi. The extent to which these improvements are directly attributable to the shift from agricultural production to game farming and the hospitality industry, as opposed to other, equally important ‘driving’ factors is what is considered briefly in the concluding chapter which follows.

Chapter 6- Conclusions:

The study is done as a single case study and this allowed the researcher to find answers in a natural setting as compared to an experimental setting or any other form of research methodology. It is from the use of this methodology that the researcher was able to come up with some information about what is happening at one particular private game reserve in the Eastern Cape.

Having said this, the researcher acknowledges the need for further; more intensive studies in this area. These studies will start by analyzing a larger research sample of both game reserves and their employees. They would also engage more critically in *comparisons* between different private game farms and between private game farms and similar state nature reserves, so as to – as far as possible - compare like with like. Lastly, it is essential that a longitudinal view is taken of these processes of shifts in production, profitability and the extent and nature of labour requirements.

Good corporate citizenship encompasses everything a company does that affects its employees, stakeholders; the wider public that consume its goods and services, as well as the environment. Corporate citizenship implies that a company ensures good corporate governance, retaining its solvency within a community. Good corporate citizenship does not always or necessarily include large-scale philanthropic projects. Whenever a company remains solvent, it retains jobs and benefits for the local area, serving that area as a good citizen. Beyond good governance and solvency, a company, whether it is local, regional, national, or global, voluntarily chooses its CSR projects and the scope of those projects to benefit the community.

Workers are unskilled and semi-literate, and find it difficult to secure other employment apart from unskilled positions on farms. Those that have permanent positions on farms or game farms remain – despite a raft of post-1994 labour legislation and security of tenure

legislation which is designed to protect their rights - wholly dependent on the goodwill of a particular land owner/employer.

It is uncommon to find three generations of worker families on the same properties. Even though workers such as these may have accumulated valuable benefits, they still do not have the assurance of owning property (land rights) of their own, and apart from state pension, are denied from receiving any form of old pension from an erstwhile employer once they retire.

Suggestions for future study

Based on the experience gained in conducting this study, the researcher suggests that there be further studies in the area of corporate citizenship in relation to PGRs is required. Moreover, that there is a need for the development of a common set of corporate social performance (CSP) measures *by sector* if corporate social impacts are to be measured accurately, using a set of commonly accepted social auditing techniques for that sector. (Snider, Hill, and Martin, 2003).

Despite there being no set measures that could be used, Mtshelazi private game reserve has taken upon itself to selectively improve the livelihood of its employees both socially and financially as a way to improve their corporate citizenship profile. Some of this is undoubtedly self-serving in that the clients and visitors to PGRs might expect not to be affronted by poverty and highly visible evidence of social deprivation among the workforce.

Any actions taken by PGRs which are directed at improving their CC standing are to be encouraged, as is self-regulation of the industry through mechanisms such as 'responsible tourism' ratings, budgeting and the like. Ultimately, however, it is the duty of organs of the state – supported by the pressure applied by advocacy groups in civil society - to intervene effectively to ensure that *all* the legislated rights, the livelihoods and the dignity of employees on PGRs and their dependants are upheld and improved. The role of the

Department of Labour and its inspectorate must feature and be seen to feature far more centrally here.

References

Allen, G & Brennan, F. 2004. **Tourism in the New South Africa: Social Responsibility and the Tourism experience.** I. B. Tauris. London

Aylward, B and Lutz, E. (Editors) 2003. **Nature tourism, conservation and development in Kwazulu- Natal. South Africa.** The World Bank.

Ashley, C. 2006. **Facilitating pro-poor tourism within the private sector: Lessons learned from pro-poor tourism pilots in Southern Africa.** Overseas Development Institute Working Paper. Report no. 2 (February), ODI and SNV

Ashley, C., Goodwin, H., McNab, D., Scott, M., and Chaves, L. 2006. **Making tourism count for the local economy in the Caribbean: Guidelines for good practice.** Pro-Tourism Partnership and CTO. April 2006. <http://www.propoortourism.org.uk/Caribbean/brief3w.pdf>

Ashley, C and Roe, D. 2002. **Making tourism work for the poor: strategies and challenges in South Africa.** *Development Southern Africa*, 19, no. 1 (March): 61-82

Ashley, C and Haysom, G. 2006. **From philanthropy to a different way of doing business: strategies and challenges in integrating pro-poor approaches into tourism business.** *Development Southern Africa*, 23, No.2 (June): 265-278

Babbie, E. and Mouton, J. 2001. **The practice of social research.** Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Bassey, M. 1999. **Case study research in educational settings.** Buckingham: Open University Press.

Boyd, H.W. 1985. **Marketing research text and cases**. Illinois: Richard Irwin.

Briassoulis, H. 1995. **The environmental externalities of tourism: theoretical analysis and policy implications**: Coccossis, H. and Nijkamp, B. (Eds). Sustainable Tourism Development. Aldershot: Avebury.

Brohman, J. 1996. **New directions in tourism for third world development**. *Annals of Tourism Research* 23 (1): 48-70.

Bryman, A. 2001. **Social research methods**. New York: Oxford University Press.

Bulls, A. 1995. **The economics of travel and tourism**. Melbourne. Longman

Butler, M. and Hallows, D. 2002. **The invisible fist. Development policy meets the world**. Pietermaritzburg: Groundwork.

Castley, J.G., Boshoff, A. F, and Kerley, G. I. H. 2001. **Compromising South Africa's natural biodiversity – inappropriate herbivore introductions**. *South Africa Journal of Science* 97: 344-348.

Cohen, L., Marion, and Morrison, K L. 2000. **Research methods in education** (5th edition). London. Routledge/ Falmer.

Connole, H. 1998. The research enterprise. In: **Research methodologies in education. Study guide**. GeeLong. Deakin University.

Cornelissen, S. 2005. **Tourism impact, distribution and development: the spatial structure of tourism in the Western Cape of South Africa**. *Development Southern Africa*. Vol 22, No 2. June

Daily Dispatch 2007. Page 7.

De Alessi, M. 2005. **Conservation through private initiative: Harnessing American ingenuity to preserve our nation's resources.** Los Angeles: Reason Foundation. Policy Study No. 328.

Dearden, P. (1991). **Tourism and sustainable development in Northern Thailand.** *Geographical Review*. Vol .8 No. 4 (October).

De Kadt. 1989. **Tourism- passport to Development.** New York. Oxford University Press.

Denzin, NK and Lincoln, YS. 2003. **The landscape of qualitative research: Theories and issues.** Thousand Oaks: London: Sage Publication.

Dieke, P., U., C. 2000. **Tourism and Africa's long-term Development Dynamics: in Dieke, PUC. (Ed). The Political Economy of Tourism Development in Africa.** New York.

Durban local Agenda. 1999.

www.ceroi.net/reports/durban/response/envman/locala21.htm. accessed on 11/09/2006.

Flick, U. 1998. **An introduction to qualitative research.** London: Sage Publication.

Flynn, P., Berry, D., and Heintz, T. 2002. **Sustainability and quality of life indicators: Towards the integration of economic, social and environmental measures. Indicators.** *The Journal of Social Health. Flynn Research.*

Gray, E., David. 2004. **Doing Research in the real world.** London: Sage Publications.

Geach, B., 2002. **Strategic environmental assessment of the Greater Addo Elephant National Park: Specialist report no. 9: Economic activities in the planning domain.** Grahamstown: Coastal and Environmental Sciences. **Unpublished report**

Hamann, R. 2006. **Can Business make decisive contributions to development? Towards a research agenda on corporate citizenship and beyond.** *Development Southern Africa* . Vol 23 (2), June: 175-193

Hartley, S. and Muhit, M. 2003. **Using qualitative research methods for the disability research in major world countries.** *Asia Pacific Disability Rehabilitation Journal*. Vol. 14 (2) pp. 103-114.

Haworth, G. 2006. **The Economic impact of private game reserve: Multiplier, Income and Employment effects and a comparison to traditional Land Use.** Unpublished Honours thesis. Rhodes University

Hussey, J and Hussey, R. (1997) **Business research: a practical guide for the undergraduate and postgraduate students.** MacMillan Business

ICLEI (International Council on Local Environmental Initiatives) 1999. **Tourism and sustainable development. Sustainable tourism: a local authority perspective-background paper Nno. 3 (April).** (www.gdrc.org/uem/eco-tour/iclei.pdf). [Accessed on 11/09/2006].

JSE SRI Index. 2004. **Background and selection criteria:** A company's duty to report on "non-financial matters." Course handout. Rhodes University

Kelly, K. 1999. Interpretive methods. In Terre Blanche, M. and Durrheim, K. (Eds) **Research in practice: Applied methods for the social sciences.** South Africa: University of Cape Town Press.

Davenport, k. 2000. **Corporate citizen: A stakeholder Approach for Defining Corporate Social Performance and Identifying Measures for assessing it.** *Business and Society*, Vol 39 no.2. (June) pp 210-219

King Report II 2002 (“King II”), 2004. **Social sustainability and corporate governance for South Africa. Background and Criteria.** Johannesburg. Institute of Directors.

King Committee on Corporate Governance. 2002. **King report on corporate governance in South Africa 2002.** Johannesburg: Institute of Directors.

Kirsten, M & Rogerson, C. M. 2002. **Tourism, Business linkages and Small Enterprise Development in South Africa.** *Development Southern Africa*, Vol 19, No 1, March. 29-61

Kramer, RL, Langholz, J, and Salafsky, N. 2002. **The role of the private sector in protected area establishment and management: A conceptual framework for analyzing effectiveness.** Pages 335-351: In J.Terborgh, C. van Shaik, L. Davenport, and M. Rao (Eds). **Making parks work: strategies for preserving tropical forests.** Covelo, CA: Island Press.

Krug, W. 2001. **Private supply of protected land in Southern Africa: A review of markets, approaches, barriers, and issues.** Paris: The World Bank & OEC

Langholz, JA. 1996. **Economics, objectives, and success of private nature reserves in Sub-Saharan Africa and Latin America.** *Conservation Biology* 10(1): 271-280.

Langholz, JA and Kerley, GIH. 2006. **Combining conservation and development on private lands: An assessment of ecotourism-based private game reserves in the Eastern Cape.** Center for African Conservation Ecology. Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University. *Ecology Research for Tomorrow.* Report no. C11. June

Langholz, JA and Lassoie, J. 2001. **Perils and promise of privately owned protected areas.** *Bioscience* 51(12): 1079-1085.

Lewis, JD. 2003. **Policies to promote growth and employment in South Africa.** The World Bank Southern Africa Department Discussion Paper. www.tips.org.za [Accessed on 11/09/2006.]

Levitt, A. 2002. **King Report on Corporate Governance for South Africa.** King Committee on Corporate Governance. Johannesburg. South Africa.

Luck, K. 2004. **Contested rights: The impact of game farming on farm workers in the Bushman's River Area.** Unpublished MA thesis. Rhodes University.

Mahony, K & van Zyl, J. 2002. **The impact of tourism investment on rural communities: Three case studies in South Africa.** *Development Southern Africa*. Vol 19, No 1. March. 83-103.

Manganeng, L. 2005. **Farm Workers and Dwellers: Fading Hopes in the Countryside: Living Conditions and Livelihoods of Farm Workers and Dwellers after a Decade of Freedom.** East Cape Agricultural Research Project Report

McCracken, GD. 1988. **The long interview.** London: Sage Publication.

Merriam, BS. 2001. **Qualitative research and the case study application in education.** San Francisco: Josse and Bass

Mitchell, B. 2006. (Editorial). **Parks** 15(2): 1-5. Gland, Switzerland: The World Conservation Union (IUCN)

Mouton, J. and Marais, HC. 1990. **Half the work, half the chance: An introduction to gender and development.** Oxford: Oxfam.

Myles, PB. 2006. **Introduction to the first thicket forum.** In: **Wilson, SL (Ed). Proceedings of the 2004 Thicket Forum.** Centre for African Conservation. Ecology Report No. 54. Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University. South Africa.

Myles, P and Mullins, E., N. 1993. **Tourism in the Eastern Cape.** Research Report 52. Port Elizabeth Institute for Planning Research.

Naidoo, R. 2002. **Corporate governance: An essential guide for South African companies.** Double Storey. Juta Company Durban

Naidoo, L., Klerck, G and Manganeng, L. 2005. **The “bite” of a minimum wage: enforcement of and compliance with the sectoral determination for farm workers.** *South African Journal of Labour Relation*: Vol 31 No. 1 (2007); 1-25

Opperman, M. and Chon, R.S. 1997. **Tourism in developing countries.** London: International Thomson Business Press.

Organization of American States (OAS), and the Caribbean Tourism Organization (CTO). 2005. **Tourism Training for the New Millennium.** www.OAS.org/tourism/trianing/3-6.pdf [Accessed: 11/09/2006.]

Page, S. 1999. **Tourism and development: the evidence from Mauritius, South Africa, and Zimbabwe.** London: Overseas Development Institute.

Parsons, R. 2004. **South Africa’s economy in 2004: stronger, richer, more just.** Economic. Snapshot. <http://www.bdfn.co.za/cqi-bin>. [Accessed: 11/09/2006.]

Patton, P. 2002. **Qualitative research and evaluation methods**. (3rd Edition) London: Sage Publication.

Peräkylä, A. 1997. **Reliability and validity in research based on transcripts**. In **Qualitative research: theory, method and practice** by Silverman, D (Ed), London: Sage Publications

Remenyi, D.1996. **So you want to be an academic researcher in business and management studies! Where do you start and what are the key philosophical issues to think about?** *South African Journal of Business Management*. 27 (1/2)

Roche, M. 1992. **Mega-events and micro-modernization: on the sociology of the new urban tourism**. *British Journal of Sociology*. Vol. 43(4), pg 563-578

Roe , P, and Urquhart, K. 2001. **Pro-poor tourism, harnessing the World's Largest Industry for the World's Poor**. IIED Preparation Document for the 2002 World Summit on Sustainable Development: Johannesburg.

Rogerson, C.M. 2003. **Tourism and transformation – small enterprises development in South Africa**. *African Insight* 33 (1/2): 108-115

Rogerson, C. M. 2007. **Reviewing Africa in a global tourism economy**. *Development Southern Africa*. *Development Southern Africa*. Vol 24, no. 3 (September). Pg 361-379

Roussot, E., W. 2005. **International tourism and economic development: A South African perspective**. PhD Thesis. UNISA.

Rubin, A., and Babbie, E. 1997. (3rd). **Research methods for social work**. Pacific Grove: Cole.

Saunders, G. 1996. The ecotourism Myth: Sustainable Tourism and Serving the Local People. Paper delivered at the Environment, Systems, Standards and Auditing Conference. Johannesburg. 20-21 May

Seidman, IE. (1991). **Interviewing as qualitative research: a guide for researchers in education and the social sciences**. New York: Teachers College Press.

Silverman, D. 1993. **Interpreting qualitative data: Methods for analyzing talk, text and Interaction**. London: Sage Publication.

Sims-Castley, R., Kerley, G.I.H., and Geach, B., 2004. **A questionnaire-based assessment of the socio-economic significance of eco-tourism-based private game reserves in the Eastern Cape**. Unpublished report for the Wilderness Foundation. Port Elizabeth: Terrestrial Ecology Research Unit, university of Port Elizabeth

Sniders, J., Hill, R. P, and Martin, D. 2003. **Corporate Social Responsibility in the 21st Century; A view from the World's Most Successful Firms**. *Journal of Business Ethics*. 48; 175-187.

Staden, van Jan Willem and Marais, ML. 2005. **The potential tourism potential of Beaufort West: a study case based on visitor demand**. *Development Southern Africa*. Vol 22, (2) June

Stake, R. 1994. **Case studies**. In Norman Denzin and Yvonna Lincoln (Eds.), **Handbook of qualitative research**, pp. 211-234. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications

South African Tourism. 2003. **Annual tourism report**. [Online] Available: www.southafrica.net/tourism/research-view. [Accessed: 11/09/2006]

Statistics South Africa. 2006. SABC NEWS: MARCH.

Statistics South Africa. 1997. Rural Survey

Struwig, FW and Stead, BG. 2001. **Planning, designing and reporting research.** Cape Town: Pearson Education.

The Good corporate Citizen. 2005 “... **pursuing sustainable business in South Africa**” (2nd Ed: A Triangle Publication, Cape Town, South Africa.

The White Paper on Tourism. 1996. South Africa: White paper on the development and promotion of tourism in South Africa. Pretoria: Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism

Tribe, J. 1995. **The economics of leisure and tourism.** London. Butterworth-Heinemann

UNICEF 2003. **The State of the World’s Children- Girls Education and Development.** New York.

United Nation Capital Development Fund (UNCDF). 2004. **Tourism, Poverty Alleviation and micro credit: a first glance. Microfinance matters.** Issue 4 July- August.

Van Rensburg, J. 2001. **On orientation to research. Research methodology – short course notes.** Rhodes University. Environmental Education Unit.

Vellas, F and Becherel, L. **International Tourism.** Hampshire: MacMillan.

Waddock, J. 2003. Integrity and Mindfulness: Foundation of Corporate Citizenship. Sheffield: Greenleaf. London

Welman, J.C. Kruger, S.J. (1994) **Research Methodology for the Business and Administrative Science.** (2nd Edition), Oxford University Press

World Business Council for Sustainable Development. 2002. Corporate Social Responsibility: The WBCSD's journey. Geneva: World Business Council for Sustainable Development

World Tourism Organisation (WTO). 2004. **Yearbook of Tourism statistics**. Madrid.

Wright, B.B. 2005. **A review of lessons learned to inform capacity-building for sustainable nature-based tourism development in the European Union funded "support to the coast spatial development initiative pilot programme"**. Masters of Education (Environmental Education). Rhodes University. unpublished

Yin, RK. 1994. **Case study research: Design and methods** (2nd edition). California. Sage. Publication

Yin, RK. 2003. **Case study research; design; methods** (3rd edition). Applied social research methods series. Sage publication.

Appendix A- Questionnaire for Game owners

Interview with Game Owners

History of the Private Game Reserves

	Presently	Previously
Size of game farm (hectares)		
Employment: Permanent workers Casuals Seasonal		
Wage bill for farm employees		
Housing (type of housing)		
Management of employees (labour issues)		

2. When was the farm established?
3. How was it established?
4. Were all the employees from previous agricultural farms converted to game farm incorporated?
5. How has the reserve ensured that employees and the community around it benefited from its activities?

Appendix B- Research questions for employees and families

Questionnaire for game reserve employees

I.D. no:

Location: Interviewer: Date:
.....

Translator: Name of respondent:
.....

Gender of respondent: Male [] Female [] Age of respondent:

Introduction

Hello. My name is I am a student from Rhodes University. As part of my MBA study, I am conducting research in private game reserves within the western part of the Eastern Cape – in the Makana municipality. The research attempts to address the issue of corporate citizenship of private game reserves within the Makana municipality. This involves the assessment of the commitment of business to the well-being of their general workers (including their families) and the communities around them. I would be grateful if you could answer these questions honestly. However, if there are some questions that you would prefer not to answer, you are free to do so. All information provided will be treated in strict confidence. Thus, in the final document, your name will not appear anywhere and no-one will be able to identify you or your family from the information that you have given. Do you agree to participate?

Details of Respondent (Head of Household)

1.1 Place of residence? _____

1.2 Size of household? Adults _____ Children (<16) _____

1.3 Who heads the household? [primary wage earner him/herself] [resident married male] [married male working away] [single divorced/widowed female] [single/divorced/widowed male] [son] [other_____]

1.4 Number of household members who are working as:

	Presently	Under previous farming regime
Full-time		
Part-time		
Seasonal		
Self-employed (incl. spaza, taxi, cash farming)		
Kitchen services		

1.5 Place of interview [house] [work place] [within the farm] [other_____]

1.6 Type of residence

	Presently	Previously
Brick house		
Shack		
Mud house		
Other (specify)		

1.6 (a) were you on the farm when it converted to a private game reserve. Yes [] no []

1.7 How long has household/ family lived on the farm/ in this area? _____

1.8 Where was the last place this family lived before you came to this farm?

1.9 Does anyone in the household have plans to move again? Yes [] No []

1.10 If yes, who, and where do they want to move to?

1.11 Does the head of this household (or someone else: who?) have secure access ('title') to:

- This residential site? Yes [] No []
- A garden? Yes [] No []. If yes, where? _____

- A field for ploughing? Yes [] No []. If yes, where?

1.12 What is your source of drinking water? Tap in the yard [] well [] borehole) [] river [] dam [] rainwater[] other _____

1.13 What do you use to cook/ light/ heat the house:

	Cook	Light	heat
Wood			
Manure			
Paraffin			
Gas			
Electricity			
Other			

1.16 What is your present occupation?

Full-time		
Part-time		
Casual/ seasonal		
Other		

1.16 (a) has this changed since you shifted from previous (agriculture) job to the present (game farming) _____?

1.17 Please list all the members of this household who presently live here (including the respondent).

No.	First name	M/F	Age	Relation to household	Std passed	Marital status	Work status	Place of work
1								
2								
3								
4								
5								
6								

7								
8								
9								

1.18 Please list all the people who are regarded as members of this household but who are presently living away from here.

No.	First name	M/F	Age	Relation to household	Std passed	Marital status	Work status	Place of work
1								
2								
3								
4								
5								
6								
7								
8								

1.19 Does your employer provide the following (Tick answer)

	Presently	Previously (agricultural farming)
Pension plan		
Medical aid		
Work contracts (written formal contracts)		
Educational plan for children (investment)		
Secure rights to residence		

If no to any of the above, give reasons why:

1.20 Do children attend school Yes [] No []. If yes, where? School within farm [] next farm [] in town [] other- specify _____ and if no, why? _____

Monthly income

Total monthly household cash income? [<500] [500 – 1000] [1000 – 2000] [>2000]

2.0 What are the main sources of income in your household, and cash and /or goods contributions?

Source of income	Give details	Less than R150	151-300	301-600	601-1200	1201-3000	R3001+
O/A pension							
Disability grant							
Salary							
Self-employed (specify)							
Child support							
Child maintenance from child's father							
Remittances/ help from family/ others							
Support from boyfriend							
Living off previous savings							
Pension from previous employer							
Retrenchment package							
Childcare, e.g. crèche							
Work							
Igqira/ixhwele							
Jobbing (explain)							
Making or repairing something (specify)							
Collecting and selling medicinal plants							
Collecting firewood							
Collecting other resources (specify)							
Hunting/fishing							
Ploughing for people							
Selling cattle							
Selling chicken							
Selling vegetables							
Selling fruit/food							

Other (specify)							
-----------------	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

2.6 Most important source of income currently for household overall? [Pension] [Formal job local _____] [Remittance] [Income from trade _____] [Other self-employment _____] [Other _____]

2.6 (a) was this different to livestock regime? [Yes] [No] If yes, in what way?

2.6 (b) Are there any other opportunities? _____

2.7 Where do you do your grocery shopping?

2.8 How frequently (tick below)?

Daily	Weekly	Monthly

2.9 Why do you choose to shop here? _____

2.10 Do you have a bank account? Yes [] No [].

3.0 Does salary get paid into bank account/ or cash?

Presently	Previously

WORKING HISTORY

4.1 When did you start working at the game reserve? _____

4.2 Why this choice of job? _____

4.3 Occupation before commencing with this? [School] [employed _____] [Unemployed] [Trading other items] [Other _____]

4.4 Where did you get the knowledge about the job?

[Game reserve training] [Seeing others work] [Self taught] [Other _____]

4.5 Has the change in type of job affected your day-to- day activities [a great deal] [a bit] [greatly] [none]

4.6 Comments/reasons? _____

4.7 How are disputes resolved here at the farm? _____ [worker's union] [management] [none] other _____

4.8 Is this job demanding compared to your previous job? No/yes elaborate _____

4.9 Which jobs do you think is better, present or previous? Explain _____

4.10 How has your quality of life changed? (Is there any improvements to the way you live) _____

4.11 In what way? [Good] [Worse] [Nothing changed] [Other - specify] _____

4.12 Have the lives of household members working at the farm improved? Yes [] No []. If yes, in what way? _____

4.13 are you afforded opportunities for further training (for future advancement) Yes [] No []

5. OTHER INCOME GENERATING ACTIVITIES

5.1 Does your household farm any fields or gardens? Yes [] No []. If yes, how big are they? _____ If no, why not? _____

5.2 Does your household own livestock?

Type of animal	Presently	Previously and how many
Cattle		
Goats		
Sheep		
Pigs		
chickens		
Other (specify: e.g. donkeys)		

If not allowed to keep livestock, is there some compensation of some sort?

5.3 What else do you do other than working at the farm?

5.4 What other products do you produce/ sale _____

5.5 Do you sell anywhere else other than here? Yes [] No [].

5.6 Where? _____

5.7 How often? _____ 5.16 which is the most important place? _____

5.8 Do you sell other natural resource products? Yes [] No [].

5.9 If yes, what? _____

5.10 When? (Season) _____ 5.20 Where?

5.11 Do you sell other types of products (e.g. .vegetables)? Yes [] No [].

5.12 If yes, what? _____

5.13 When? (Season) _____ 5.24 Where?

5.14 Approximate income from sales in last day/week/month/year?

